Minority Government: Gender, Race, and Leadership in News Coverage of the 2021 Canadian Federal

Election

by

Gavriel Kesik-Libin

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Bachelor of Arts (Honours)

in

Political Science

Department of Political Science

University of Alberta

ABSTRACT

As Canadian politics becomes increasingly leader-centric, the news media plays an important role in how voters internalise the personalities, policy priorities, and leadership styles of major political party leaders. Voters turn to the media to aid their decision on which party leader is best suited to lead the country, but an extensive body of literature suggests that the news media disproportionately scrutinises and attaches assumptions to women and racialized party leaders. Given that the 2021 Canadian federal election marked the first time two racialized party leaders contested the Prime Ministerial role, and the first time a racialized woman led a national-level political party into a general election, this thesis investigates the intersection between these variables and long-standing journalistic practices that perpetuate gendered and racialized mediation. I question how gender and race was constructed in news media coverage of the 2021 Canadian federal election, and what the gendered and racialized news coverage (if any exists) of this election reveals about broader social discourses surrounding suitability for political leadership. Through quantitative content analysis and critical discourse analysis of news articles covering key points in the 2021 election, I demonstrate how the news media used race and gender to construct an ideal standard for political leadership, comment on who 'belongs' in Canadian politics, and grapple with a changing political landscape.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

INTRODUCTION

This thesis uncovers how gender and race was constructed in news coverage of the 2021 Canadian federal election, and how these constructions contribute to discourses on political leadership in Canada. To do so, I have analysed how, over the course of the 2021 election campaign, the news media reported on each of the four major party leaders: Justin Trudeau (Liberal Party of Canada), Erin O'Toole (Conservative Party of Canada), Jagmeet Singh (New Democratic Party of Canada), and Annamie Paul (Green Party of Canada). I have chosen to define 'party leaders' as leaders of any party that, as of the 2021 federal election, held seats in the Federal House of Commons. The exception to this rule is Bloc Quebecois leader Yves-François Blanchet, who I have excluded from this analysis given the regional specificity of his party and political goals.

My analysis seeks out themes of masculinity, racialization, and gender, as well as discourses on political leadership and Canadian electoral politics in general. Given the extent of academic study on gendered and racialized mediation, this thesis adds to this robust body of research by investigating how these themes remain pervasive and relevant in the Canadian context. I have focused on digital and print news articles published during several main points in the election cycle, including the writ issue, the leaders' debates, major campaign announcements, and election night. My project ultimately aims to reveal whether and how news media coverage of the party leaders constructed a gendered and racialized understanding of Canadian electoral politics and political leadership.

In 2008, Andrew et al. commented that "there is an archetype of the Canadian elected official - male, White, middle-class, middle aged, Christian, Canadian-born, and majority language speaking." (Andrew et al. 2008, 255) Nearly fifteen years later, their sentiment is no less true. Visible minorities make up less than sixteen percent of the 44th Canadian Parliament (Black & Griffith 2022), and women make up just over thirty percent, despite occupying more than half of the population (Inter-Parliamentary Union 2022). Women and racialized Parliamentarians are continually perceived as outside the norm, which becomes significant when one occupies the role of party leader. Governments are becoming

increasingly leader-centric, with voters turning to the personalities of individual leaders to mobilise them at the polls (McAllister 2007, 583). This leader-centrism is motivated in large part by the news media, who shape how leaders are perceived and prime them to the public for electoral evaluation (581). Given that the news media tends to focus on novelty to maximise viewership, these three factors (underrepresentation, leader-centrism, and novelty) form an insidious combination.

The news media and the frames it employs are essential factors in influencing public discourse. The news media has a primary function of determining stories that tell the public what is important (McCombs & Shaw 1972, 184). In this sense, media framing can shape both what is currently societally relevant and broader, long-standing social discourses. This thesis approaches the issue of how racialized and gendered understandings of Canadian politics can be reproduced and reinforced by the news media.

Thesis Outline

My research question asks: How was gender and race constructed in news media coverage of the four major party leaders in the 2021 Canadian federal election, and what does this reveal about broader social discourses surrounding suitability for political leadership? In Chapter One, I explore existing literature on gendered and racialized mediation, both in terms of their theoretical bases, and how they have manifested themselves in Canadian politics over time. I also outline my methodological approach to this project and provide a rationale for selecting the 2021 Canadian federal election as my chosen case study.

Chapter Two analyses and reviews the quantitative data collected from my coding process, building on existing literature to determine how the news media constructed race, gender, and leadership through specific lexical and framing choices. This chapter contains data collected on coverage of the writ issue, major campaign announcements, the English leaders' debate, and election night. In Chapter Three, I draw broader conclusions from the qualitative coding process I undertook for each article, and comment on overarching themes or narratives that emerged across all data sets. In Chapter Four, I discuss the implications of my findings, what they mean for the state of Canadian political media, and their insights

into Canadian politics and its ever-changing nature. Finally, I conclude by reaffirming the ramifications of my findings and discussing opportunities for future research in this area.

CHAPTER ONE

Theoretical Background, Literature Review, and Methodology

Introduction

To provide context to my research, this chapter will survey key theoretical concepts and relevant literature on gendered and racialized mediation. I define and operationalize essential components of my research such as gendered mediation, racialized mediation, gatekeeping, and agenda setting; and survey literature which applies these concepts in modern political contexts. Operationalizing my definitions ensures that the conclusions drawn in this thesis may be interpreted consistently, and providing a broad cross-section of literature on theoretical applications demonstrates the strong evidentiary basis behind my hypotheses and arguments. This chapter begins by outlining my theoretical background and operationalizing the theoretical framework that has structured the execution of my research. Next, I will situate these terms into modern political contexts by surveying the relevant literature on gendered and racialized mediation in Canada and other Commonwealth countries. I conclude by outlining my methodological approach and providing a rationale for selecting the 2021 Canadian federal election as my chosen case study.

Theoretical Background

Mediation, Gatekeeping, and Agenda Setting

Mediation is defined as the "selection, construction, production, and consumption of the news" (cited in Tolley 2016). This process has three core elements: the construction and framing of stories by the press, the instrumental use of the news media by political actors, and the ways in which the structure and organisation of the news media shapes stories (Sampert & Trimble 2010, 2; cited in Tolley 2016). In undertaking mediation, the news media often engages in the process of gatekeeping, such that it determines which information consumers will receive, and precisely how it is conveyed to the masses (Shoemaker & Vos 2009, 3). Understanding mediation allows these processes to converge and provides

insight into how these processes construct the news media as an information-sharing, worldview-building, and political sphere-shaping tool.

News media also holds the function of agenda setting, such that it "[determines] stories that tell the public what is important" (Everbach 2017, 270) (McCombs & Shaw 1972, 184). Given that the representation of women and racialized people in mass media is typically reflective of shared meanings and understandings of their role in society (Everbach 2017, 274), agenda setting by the news media and gendered or racialized discourses have a mutually reinforcing relationship. Digging deeper into this relationship and applying it to the study of political leadership and Canadian electoral politics can provide important insight into how varied reproductions of these narratives impact those contesting the Prime Ministerial post, and how these individuals are ultimately perceived by and presented to the electorate. The importance of news media provides a solid foundation for my methodology. Given its role in influencing public discourses and understandings of race and gender, analysing news media coverage of elections allows me to analyse how these understandings are communicated, and how these fit into the narratives that structure Canadian politics.

Gendered Mediation

The gendered mediation thesis remains consistent across the study of the relationship between women in political life and the media. Gidengil and Everitt define gendered mediation as when the news media incorporates "gendered assumptions about politics and politicians" into its mediation or coverage of the political sphere (Gidengil & Everitt 2003a, 561). These gendered assumptions construct an understanding of politics that is dominated by a male-oriented agenda, leaving women politicians to be seen as outside of the norm and creating the conditions for their differential mediation (Sreberny-Mohammadi & Ross 2000, 93). Gendered mediation is a systemic issue, meaning it reflects deeply rooted ideas about the patriarchy, and more specifically, the natural correspondence between politics and masculinity (Tolley 2016, 28).

The news media tends to employ different language when covering female politicians in comparison to their male counterparts. This language is based on assumptions that reflect a gendered worldview and mediation process (Gidengil & Everitt 2003a, 561). The news media often casts women in an unfavourable light while lauding the accomplishments of their male colleagues (Sreberny-Mohammadi & Ross 1996, 110). Stories about women politicians are more likely to include non-neutral verbs, and when women behave contrary to feminine expectations, the media gives disproportionate scrutiny to this behaviour (Gidengil & Everitt 2003b; cited in Tolley 2016, 28).

Additionally, irrelevant personal details are also much more likely to be included in stories covering women politicians (Burke & Mazzarella 2010, 409). While the news media will typically publish personal details about a candidate regardless of their gender, it is a characteristic feature of gendered mediation that discrepancies in the amount and content of personalised reporting occur on the basis of the candidate's gender (Burke & Mazzarella 2010, 398). Women's news coverage is more likely to emphasise their appearance, wardrobe, femininity, and family life (Gidengil & Everitt 2003b; cited in Tolley 2016, 27). This represents an attempt to tabloidize and capitalise on the novelty of women politicians, such that their existence and actions are constructed as entertainment news rather than focusing on serious political accomplishments. Even then, women's political accomplishments are significantly downplayed compared to those of their male counterparts. Women are often portrayed as having an exclusive interest in 'soft' policy issues, such as child, family, and other social policy (cited in Tolley 2016, 27-28). This stands in direct contrast to their male counterparts, who are frequently associated with 'hard' policy issues such as the economy, science, and national defence. This is compounded by the fact that women are quite often framed as women first, applying a focus on their demographic characteristics to the entirety of their coverage, even when it is irrelevant (Trimble & Trieberg 2008, cited in Tolley 2016, 27). This serves to further reinforce the concept of women politicians as novels and outsiders, creating the conditions for further differential mediation.

All in all, Goodyear-Grant provides five essential characteristics of gendered mediation that will guide my analysis and research (Goodyear-Grant 2007, 44). They are as follows:

1. Media framing of politics is masculine in character, and deeply rooted historical assumptions about gendered behaviour influence coverage.

2. News media pays disproportionate attention to the counter-stereotypical behaviours of women politicians, which is a product of both gendered behavioural norms and the desire for novelty on the part of the news media.

3. The news media presents a more filtered, mediated version of women politician's behaviour than it does for the behaviour of their male counterparts.

4. Women politicians are linked more closely with social or care-oriented policy issues, whereas male politicians are linked with 'hard' policy issues. This is a product of gender roles that associate women with motherliness and compassion and men with aggression and strength. The heuristic function of news media also prompts reliance on stereotypes for fast information-sharing.

5. Women journalists are unable to compensate for gendered mediation given that gendered news is deeply rooted in both cultural norms and the mechanics of the newsroom, neither of which can be rehabilitated on an individual scale.

Race and Racialized Mediation

Race is a social marker which can serve to both oppress and exclude (Pateman & Mills 2007, 105; cited in Tolley 2016). Discourses of racial supremacy are deeply ingrained into Canadian institutions, particularly given Canada's historical "structure and culture of dominance" against Indigenous peoples and other racialized groups (Miller et al. 1998, 80). Similar to what has been observed in gendered mediation, these dynamics give way to social discourses surrounding the place of visible minorities in public life, their leadership capabilities, and their role in the political sphere. Racialized populations have also been symbolically annihilated throughout history, meaning they have been fundamentally excluded from adequate representation. This has been seen to be in line with negative

representations, given that media is a site where hegemonic discourses and meanings are facilitated (Coleman & Yochim 2008, 2-7).

Erin Tolley provides a theory of *racialized mediation,* such that race influences the "framing, angle, discourse and effect" of news media coverage (Tolley 2016, 26). Racial mediation posits that politics are covered in the news media in ways that reflect dominant cultural norms, long standing organisational practices, and the assumption of whiteness as standard (Tolley 2016, 29). Race does not appear organically in news coverage, but rather is a defining factor of how stories are selected, framed, and responded to (30). Given that racial supremacy is a historically defining factor of Canadian political institutions, it follows that race is continually viewed as a novel social marker. When whiteness is constructed as standard, those who do not conform to these standards are seen as inherently unfamiliar and will thus receive differential news coverage.

In defining racialized mediation, it is essential to distinguish between *racist* and *racialized* news coverage. Racialization occurs when individuals or groups become identified, named, and categorised based on race (Fleras 2011, 58; cited in Tolley 2016). This does not imply stereotyping or misrepresentations of reality but is rather a product of deeply ingrained race-based ideals in institutional structures. In *racialized* mediation, race simply becomes the salient or defining factor in an individual or group's coverage. This may also be a result of a candidate's self-presentation, such as Jagmeet Singh's tendency to embrace his Sikh heritage (Bouchard 2020, 2). News media coverage certainly has the potential to, and has been, explicitly racist, although in studying racialized mediation, the aim is not to reprimand reporters but rather investigate the underlying discourses that contribute to the emergence of race as a salient factor in coverage.

Tolley posits two ways in which racialized mediation typically manifests itself. Firstly, coverage can contain explicit racial content, such as descriptive racial or socio-demographic content related to skin colour, ethnicity, linguistic background, or interest in "minority issues" (Tolley 2016, 30). This can be both direct, where such factors are explicitly mentioned, or indirect, such as through references to support from ethnic or racial communities (30). This coverage may be both positive and negative, although its

defining quality is that it "injects race into the narrative," often to the exclusion of policy, qualifications, or non-racial character attributes (30). Secondly, racialized mediation may be latent, such that it affects the type of policy or viability coverage received by the candidate (31). This would include whether candidates with similar qualifications are presented as equally viable for leadership, or if minority candidates are portrayed as less viable all else being equal (31).

Lastly, racialized coverage is not entirely restricted to visible minority candidates. Racialized coverage may present itself in questioning the motives for selecting candidates - i.e. Does Canada need another white male Prime Minister? - or may again be a product of self-presentation, although this does typically not bode well for non-minority candidates (Tolley 2016, 33). This phenomenon is certainly less common than racialized mediation of visible minority candidates, although I have chosen to incorporate it through covering all major party leaders. This is done with the goal of producing a more robust body of research and exploring how discourses of whiteness and racialization may interact.

Media coverage is both racialized and gendered (Tolley 2016, 29) - but do these variables interact? Kimberle Crenshaw proposes a theory of intersectionality as a retort to feminism positioned solely in relation to sex discrimination (Crenshaw 1989, 144). This is an insufficient lens through which to view the experiences of Black women, who may experience discrimination based on the combination of race and sex. This is often viewed as contradictory, yet this contradiction arises from the tendency to view race and sex discrimination as independent phenomena which can only be viewed unidirectionally (149). Crenshaw likens this to a busy intersection, wherein "discrimination… may flow in one direction, and it may flow in another. If an accident happens in an intersection, it can be caused by cars travelling from any number of directions, and sometimes, from all of them." (149)

Crenshaw's analysis is particularly relevant when analysing the dual effects of racialized and gendered mediation. My analysis involves two visible minority candidates: Jagmeet Singh and Annamie Paul, the latter of whom is a Black woman. Paul is the first Black woman to lead a Canadian federal political party (Akin 2021), which immediately assigns her a degree of novelty and newsworthiness. Given Paul's status as both a racialized person and a woman, then, it can be inferred based on Crenshaw's

work and the theories discussed above that she will experience both racialized and gendered mediation. Crenshaw's work also implies that Paul may face a unique form of treatment by the news media, one which arises from her unique status as a Black woman, and that which cannot be viewed through racialization and gendered mediation theories alone.

Critical theoretical insights on gendered and racialized mediation guide the execution of both my content and discourse analyses. In developing her theory of racialized mediation, Dr. Erin Tolley developed an extensive coding framework to generate her influential insights. I have borrowed from this framework in analysing instances of racialized mediation in my particular research contexts, and adjusted it based on Goodyear-Grant's criteria of gendered mediation. Further, I have applied an intersectional lens based on Crenshaw's insights in analysing coverage of Annamie Paul. In analysing how each of the leaders are positioned in relation to race and gender, I paid particular attention to Paul's experiences as a black woman, and how this influenced her coverage and portrayal by the news media.

Literature Review

Gendered and Racialized Coverage

Gendered Coverage

A key feature of gendered mediation is the construction of women politicians as novel. Cameron and Shaw find that politics is increasingly focused on the "actions, words, and personalities of individual party leaders. This focus on party leaders is usually a focus on men" (Cameron & Shaw 2020, 151). The novelty of women's political participation makes it particularly newsworthy, accounting for increased coverage and attention, but particularly that which focuses on their gender as a salient characteristic (151). The news media treats individual female party leaders as a monolithic group, whose personalities and communication styles were starkly contrasted with "the men" (151), although this is not always negative - gender is often regarded as an asset, particularly if one's party needed modernization and a departure from traditionality (152). Such narratives can coexist with the idea that a woman's gender can act as a political deficiency, constructing women's political participation as a "visibly different form of

politics" (153). This indicates that women must be both representative of their gender and distant from it, creating what is often referred to as a "double bind" for women attempting to craft a public image. Nonetheless, women in the political sphere as a group are constructed as novel and outside the norm, making them particularly vulnerable to disproportionate scrutiny by the news media.

Continuing with the theme of personalization, something I have identified as essential to studying gendered mediation, Trimble et al. find that while personalization is not a salient dynamic in news coverage (Trimble et al. 2013, 473), its occurrence differs greatly based on candidate gender. In fact, their principal argument arising from their results is that personalization is a symptom of gendered mediation, and not the inverse (474). Unsurprisingly, personalization references were much more likely to appear in editorials and columns, given that they serve as "spaces in the newspaper where journalists are allowed to express their gender biases without being constrained by the normal professional practice of objectivity" where opinion writers "connect "facts" about a candidate's physical persona or domestic life to evaluations of his or her electoral viability, character, and suitability for office" (474). These findings indicate, as I predicted, a harmful interaction between a candidate's salient identity markers (such as race or gender) and the increasing personalization of the political sphere.

An essential component of personalization is scrutiny and coverage of a woman's body. Trimble et al. find that columnists are more likely to scrutinise a female candidate's body when the woman in question is proximate to political power, indicating a degree of discomfort with women in influential positions (Trimble et al. 2015, 320). Descriptions of bodies, clothing, and deportment serve as metaphors for women's supposed inability to assume political leadership (320). Columnists equate women's wardrobes with their ability to conform to standards of idealised femininity, making subtle implications about their viability for leadership (321). Physical attractiveness is also weighted differently in news media evaluations of both women and men - while it is seen to be a political asset for male candidates, the news media attributes female candidate's good looks to sexual promiscuity (322). Associating female bodies with their beauty serves to place women as the objects (and not subjects) of political discourse, undermining their perceived political legitimacy and authenticity (322).

Trimble also finds that women's appearances have the potential to become salient features of their news media coverage, trumping their policy positions or the political matters of the day. By directing disproportionate attention to these features, news reporting further constructs women politicians as novel, which subtly calls their political legitimacy into question (Duerst-Lahti 2006, 37; cited in Trimble 2017). In studying women Prime Ministers in Australia, New Zealand, and Canada, it was found that news media often called in "pundits, style gurus, and political opponents" to speak, "sometimes at length, on the subject of the women leader's clothing" (Trimble 2017, 128). This commentary was more often evaluatory than descriptive, further linking the women's appearances with their viability for office and leadership capabilities. Trimble ultimately argues that because media discourses reflect culturally inscribed norms and assumptions, news media commentary on the physical appearance of political candidates are likely to reveal assumptions and standards for what the "quintessential leader should (and should not) look like" (131).

Racialized Coverage

Dr. Erin Tolley's analysis of news media coverage of the 2008 federal election finds significant support for the racialized mediation thesis. Explicit socio-demographic coverage remains a persistent theme in electoral news mediation, drawing marked attention to the "ethnic" nature of an individual's candidacy, whether that be in relation to their previous profession, identity, or role in the house of commons. She quotes an article describing Conservative MP Tim Uppal as "nothing if not distinctive in the Commons… in a body of white, middle-aged males, Mr. Uppal is that young man (he sports a remarkably bushy beard) wearing the vibrant Tory blue turban" (cited in Tolley 2013, 97). The news media also tends to explicitly reference a candidate's heritage or immigrant status, even if they are second-generation immigrants to Canada (97). Implicit references to socio-demographic characteristics were also often made through reference to a candidate's support in a given community or the racial makeup of their riding - these are the most common ways in which reference to socio-demographic

information is made (98). Interestingly, in this analysis, all mentions of candidate race were made in relation to visible minority candidates (98).

Tolley also undertakes an analysis of leadership viability in relation to racialized mediation. She finds that most viability coverage is mundane, providing merely a repetition of the facts of a given candidate's race (107). However, several interesting narratives emerge among instances that stray from the facts, such as the "model minority" or "immigrant success story" narrative (108). These often exist in tandem with devices that subtly downplay the qualifications of racialized and gendered candidates - such as referring to someone as "a girl from Winnipeg" and "a model Liberal candidate who offers health care expertise, too." (cited in Tolley 2013, 108). Mentions of candidate quality, however, are surprisingly rare, and do not differ based on candidate race (109). Neither does mention of political outsider or insider status, although these occur quite frequently but contradict the assumption that racialized candidates will be consistently portrayed as outsiders (the opposite is true). In assessing viability, well-known visible minority candidates are accorded somewhat more viability coverage than White candidates, but visible minority viability coverage suffers when they are not incumbents (111).

Regarding policy issue association, it was found that there is a statistically significant relationship between candidate race and mentions of immigration and multiculturalism policy (115). However, there is no statistically significant relationship between visible minority candidates and social welfare issues (114), leading Tolley to conclude the following: that the link between race and "minority issues" is only partially applicable in the Canadian context, that visible minority candidates are more likely than White candidates to be connected to crime issues (indicating that crime is a racialized policy issue in Canada) (116), and that white candidates will be more likely to be associated with 'mainstream' policy issues (i.e. those other than crime, social welfare, or immigration and multiculturalism) (116). Tolley also finds that visible minority candidates are more strongly linked to rights issues, such as those concerning Indigenous peoples and the 2SLGBTQ+ community, often to the exclusion of their hard policy stances (117). This may leave voters with the impression that they do not possess a well-rounded focus on the political issues

of the day, which is particularly problematic if the coverage reinforces stereotypes about candidate capabilities (117).

Besco et al. confirm the racialized mediation effect in coverage of the 2014 Toronto mayoral election, which featured Oliva Chow as a prominent candidate. Chow originally hails from Hong Kong but has lived in Canada since childhood and served as a Canadian public servant in several respects. Despite this, her coverage disproportionately focused on her status as an immigrant (Besco 2016, 4654). Besco et al. posit that this is because "being non-White is practically synonymous with being an immigrant in Canadian public discourse" (4654). However, Chow also participated in fostering an immigrant-centred lens for her campaign, reaffirming Tolley's findings that racialized mediation may also be a product of a candidate's self-presentation. However, her news media coverage did resort to racialized policy tropes, such as consistently referencing her support in immigrant or Chinese communities and putting her racial identity at the forefront through descriptors such as "the [potential] first non-White mayor in Toronto's history" (4655).

My theoretical basis questioned whether the combination of race and gender would worsen news media coverage, in line with Kimberle Crenshaw's theory of intersectionality. Tolley's evidence speaks to the contrary in some respects, and she concludes that "the intersection of gender and race augments the effects [of media coverage] only in some cases" (Tolley 2013, 141). Visible minority men are more likely to be connected to crime policy, while visible minority women are more likely to be connected to social welfare, immigration, and multiculturalism policy issues (than their respective male/female visible minority counterparts) (141), but this does not extend to all coverage. Overall, "it does not appear that intersectionality has a widespread impact on policy issue coverage, rather, the effects are more targeted and specific." (141)

However, in terms of underlying discourses surrounding race and gender, Tolley's sample found that visible minority women candidates were *the only* candidates to receive novelty-based coverage (142). Even stories that were ostensibly supportive of visible minority candidates employed explicitly racialized and gendered references, reinforcing the outsider status of visible minority women in Canadian politics,

and perpetuating harmful stereotypes. Visible minority women were also more likely to be questioned in terms of their suitability for office, often by invoking questions of age, immigration status, and heritage. These markers cue to readers that the evaluation of a given candidate should sway towards 'unsuitable' (145), indicating that Canadian politics has yet to afford equal treatment and dignity to all candidates.

<u>Lexical Choices and Leaders Debates</u>

Studying the news media's construction of reported speech is an essential component of both gendered and racialized mediation scholarship. This proves particularly important to my project, not only in general coverage of the leaders and how they present to the public, but in studying the highly publicised spectacles of the leaders' debates. Coverage of the leaders' debates relies almost entirely on reporting candidate speech as the articles reconstruct the events of the debate. This gives way to an important niche in gendered mediation as it relates to the lexical choices of journalists in covering reported speech. Here, I will survey literature related to both linguistic processes and gendered mediation as they connect to reported speech.

Chen provides several classifications of reported speech that have informed my content coding framework (Appendix A) and are essential to understanding the underlying discourses behind reported speech. Negative verbal processes can be defined as those that introduce an "element of doubt or scepticism… about the veracity of what the speaker is saying… [or demonstrate] a certain negativity of feeling on the part of the writer towards the person whose words the verbal process is being used to introduce" (Chen 2005, 37). These often function to imply that what the speaker has said is not necessarily rooted in fact, conferring a degree of unreliability upon them. Neutral verbal processes can be defined as those that carry "little indication whatever of the writer's attitude towards what the speaker is saying… the writer chooses to offer neither endorsement nor disparagement" (38). Positive verbal processes can be defined as those which "somehow promote in the reader a feeling that the person whose words are being reported is wise, authoritative… or in some other sense positive" (39).

Positive, negative, and neutral speech verbs play an essential role in gendered mediation. Gidengil and Everitt find that neutral verbs are used significantly less often in reporting women's speech, and that while negative verbs are used less frequently overall, they appeared more often in coverage of women candidates (Gidengil & Everitt 2003c, 221). In the 1995 election, verbs used to report women's speech were twice as likely to appear among the 25 most negatively rated speech verbs, and this figure increased to three times as likely in the 1997 election (222). Women candidates were less likely to be framed as speaking for themselves, indicating that the news media feels more need to interpret the behaviour of female candidates, and the use of unconventionally negative verbs to describe the women's speech further highlights their perpetual construction as novelties (225).

Trimble argues that women in the political sphere are scrutinised when they are perceived to be transgressing speaking rules for political discourse, and that women in the political elite are punished for speaking in certain ways or raising certain topics (Trimble 2017, 185). This reflects "a latent sense of disquiet about powerful women" (186), meaning women's speech is often trivialised or questioned on its general effectiveness (187). Trimble's findings confirm those of Gidengil and Everitt, such that the news media frequently renders women unable to speak for themselves, such as in coverage of Conservative Party leadership candidate Belinda Stronach. Stronach was frequently characterised as "highly scripted," implying her speech was merely a "parroting" of the "thoughts, words, and desires of the men seeking to put her in power." (188) This is but one example of the news media's tendency to cast doubt upon the words of women in political power, depriving them of political legitimacy and warping perceptions of their leadership viability.

Reported speech is also an essential component of understanding coverage of leaders' debates, something on which my project has a substantial focus. Coverage of leaders' debates focuses on both the reported speech and the reported actions of the leaders, which when combined, can further the effect of gendered and racialized mediation. Gidengil and Everitt find that metaphors used in coverage of televised leaders' debates reflect a highly masculinized narrative (Gidengil & Everitt 2003a, 572). Coverage of leaders' debates frequently employs metaphors relating to warfare, such as describing the leaders'

behaviour as "on the offensive", "attacked on all fronts", or "under fire from all sides" (568). Other common narratives and metaphors included those related to sports and games or general violence, reflecting a tendency on the part of the news media to resort to reification of the masculine political norm. Employing metaphors related to violence, warfare, and sport serve to cast women as outsiders to the political 'game', both by situating them in a context in which they are not welcome and painting their behaviour as transgressive or overly aggressive (574).

Turning the focus towards racialized candidates, Tolley finds that overall, visible minority candidates are less likely to be quoted in news coverage than their white counterparts. This was found to be rooted in powerful assumptions about the ability of racialized candidates to present themselves as articulate or "quotable" (Tolley 2013, 123). However, there is a significant gap in the literature relating to coverage of racialized party leaders in leaders' debates. This is likely because Canada had not seen a visible minority lead a federal political party until 2017, when Jagmeet Singh became leader of the NDP. This project therefore seeks to fill this gap through studying Singh and Paul's coverage in the leaders' debates. Given the parallels between gendered and racialized mediation that have appeared in the literature thus far, my assumptions about the coverage of Singh and Paul in the debates were guided by insights from Gidengil and Everitt on 'othering' through hegemonic masculine narratives, as well as their insights on the disproportionate allocation of negative speech verbs to women candidates. In sum, I expected that visible minority candidates would be racialized through reported speech and leaders' debate coverage through the same mechanisms by which women candidates are gendered, although the effect would likely be lessened for Jagmeet Singh given that he is a man.

Mediation of Masculinity

In understanding gendered mediation, it is important to consider the idea that "men have a gender too" (Carver 1996; cited in Smith 2021, 2). Smith seeks to understand whether certain types of men, i.e., those who possess certain attributes of masculinity, face an advantage in running for political leadership. In doing so, she argues that "to say that 'politics is masculine' does not mean that all men will inevitably

benefit. The male advantage in politics may only be reserved for 'masculine' men, and/or the most masculine candidate" (Smith 2021, 3). Oftentimes, a male candidates' reliability is grounded in representations of their gender (16). This manifests itself through adoption of the 'decent man' narrative, which is grounded in family man ideals of hegemonic masculinity. Candidate presentations of masculinity also serve to further reinforce the novelty of women in politics, such that men are presented as 'one of the boys' or insiders to the political game (18).

While gendered mediation literature often focuses on coverage of women's bodies in assessing novelty and political leadership, the male body can play an important role in reaffirming constructions of hegemonic masculinity in Canadian politics. Trimble et al. find that coverage of male candidate's bodies served to authenticate and legitimate their political leadership, situating their bodies as objects of physical prowess and authority (Trimble et al. 2015, 320). This was done through repeated references to the physical size and physique of leadership candidates, reinforcing the hegemonically masculine political norm (320). However, this only benefitted those who conformed to conventional male beauty standards - those who strayed from the ideal physique were dismissed as lacking viability for leadership roles (320). This reveals a tendency on behalf of the news media to equate political leadership with physical strength and hegemonic constructions of masculinity, relegating those who do not meet these standards to political outsider status. Such a demotion diminishes perceptions of viability for leadership. Ultimately, masculinity, power, and leadership are "so entangled that to be perceived as a 'strong' leader requires a particular corporeal performance of masculinity" (Duerst-Lahti & Kelly 1995, 19; cited in Trimble et al. 2015).

A third important theme to consider in studying hegemonic masculinity is that of the family. Auer et al argue that during election campaigns, "men display their wives and children as a way of aligning their public personas with societal values and expectations" (Trimble 2017; cited in Auer et al. 2020, 3). Demonstrating that they are compassionate fathers allows men to position themselves as empathetic without compromising their masculinity and authoritativeness (3). Auer et al. ultimately uncover a family discourse in news coverage of politicians' families, which articulates the idealised, nuclear family as an

indicator of political legitimacy and capability (6). The trope of the family man features heavily to

provide "evidence of sound character, likeability, and heteropatriarchal marital relations" (6). This trope

was present only in coverage of male candidates - no such association existed for women. Coverage of

women's families casted them as political mothers, reflecting their continued association with the

domestic sphere and reinforcing the hegemonically masculine character of the political sphere (8).

Trimble confirms the positive effect of the family strategy on men's campaigns, arguing that this is

reflective of the public man/private woman dichotomy (Trimble 2017, 106). In this sense, women with

unconventional families or who are perceived to strike the wrong balance between work and family will

be villainized for not conforming to this hegemonically masculine ideal.

Hypotheses

Based on the relevant literature, I developed the following hypotheses that guided the execution

of my research:

H1: Annamie Paul will be covered differentially in comparison to Trudeau, O'Toole, and Singh. She will
experience increased personalization, disproportionate association with 'soft' policy issues, and her
gender will consistently appear as a salient feature in her coverage. This will function to frame her as
novel and diminish her perceived leadership viability.

H2: Jagmeet Singh and Annamie Paul will be covered differentially in comparison to Trudeau and
O'Toole. Their racialized status will appear as a salient feature in their coverage, they will be
disproportionately associated with 'minority' policy issues, and they will be framed as novelties
compared to the other candidates.

H3: Jagmeet Singh will be covered differentially in comparison to Trudeau and O'Toole. He will be both
racialized and gendered, although differently from Paul. Trudeau and O'Toole's proximity to white
hegemonic masculinity will be forefronted to decrease perceptions of Singh's leadership viability. This
will manifest itself through tactics such as the family strategy, adoption of the 'decent man' persona, or
relation of Trudeau and O'Toole's bodies to ideals of political leadership.

H4: In reporting speech, the news media will disproportionately assign negative speech verbs to Annamie
Paul only. Both Paul and Jagmeet Singh will be quoted less, and they will less often be the speaker or
subject (but rather object) in coverage of reported speech. O'Toole and Trudeau will benefit most from
coverage of reported speech.

Methodology

To conduct my research, I undertook a mixed method analysis while incorporating a critical research approach. This consisted of a quantitative content analysis of the media texts followed by a critical discourse analysis. I found a mixed content-discourse analysis to be suitable for my research on several fronts. Firstly, a mixed-method approach provides important holistic insights that can be analysed in the context of gendered and racialized power imbalances, as well as in relation to the Canadian political sphere. Secondly, employing a critical lens assists in revealing how the news media reproduces and reinforces gendered and racialized understandings of politics. Incorporating quantitative content analysis into this dynamic provided a strong evidentiary basis for my findings.

Prior to outlining the details of my mixed-method analysis, it is essential to define a key concept that structures my methodology. In conducting my research, I worked with two operational definitions of the concept of media framing. Reese defines framing on a broader scale as "persistent organising principles that structure the social world." (Reese 2001, 5) In defining framing specifically in relation to the news media, I employed the definition developed by Chong and Druckman, wherein framing is "the process by which people develop a particular conceptualization of an issue or reorient their thinking about an issue." (Chong & Druckman 2007, 104) Combining these two definitions, I defined media frames for the purposes of this project as persistent organising principles within news media that develop conceptualizations of or reorient opinions towards a given issue. This definition guided the execution of both my content analysis and my critical discourse analysis.

My content analysis determined the manifest (literal) content of the media texts (cited in Trimble & Treiberg 2015, 228). I did so by analysing the frequency with which certain frames, narratives, and lexical choices occurred in my media texts. This determined the extent to which such variables remained persistent across news media coverage of the leaders. Subjecting my news media texts to a quantitative content analysis was useful in empirically understanding and demonstrating patterns within the news media texts as they related to constructions of race and gender. I chose to model my coding framework off of that developed by Dr. Erin Tolley in her analysis of racialized mediation, while integrating linguistic insights developed by Chen and several other scholars referenced in my literature review. I

altered Tolley's framework to include insights on lexical choices as well as coding criteria specific to gendered and racialized mediation. The variables defining my coding framework can be viewed in Appendix A.

For a complete comprehension of the presence of gendered and racialized themes in the news media texts, and to situate them in the context of broader media frames, I accompanied my quantitative content analysis findings with a qualitative discourse analysis. Additionally, to fully answer my research questions, I must understand how the frames, narratives, and lexical choices construct a gendered and racialized understanding of Canadian politics. Discourse analysis, specifically a critical discourse analysis, accomplishes these goals sufficiently. Discourse analysis can be defined as an examination of the meanings reflected in the discourses - the statements in a text that produce a specific narrative - of news media sources (cited in Trimble & Treiberg 2015, 228). This approach is therefore effective in both identifying instances of racialized and gendered discourses within news media sources while also interpreting the meanings produced by these discourses within the broader context of Canadian political leadership. Critical discourse analysis "investigates the ways in which discourses reflect, reproduce, and reinforce relationships of dominance" (Trimble & Treiberg 2015, 235). I employed a critical approach in my discourse analysis by examining how the discourses of mediation reflect dominant gendered and racialized understandings, as well as how idealizations of Canadian politics and political leadership were constructed through these discourses.

Original Sources

To conduct this research, I analysed print and digital news articles drawn from Canadian news media outlets. Within each media text, I analysed the headline in conjunction with the full text of the article. The sources I drew media texts from are as follows: *National Post, The Globe and Mail, CBC News, Macleans,* and *Global News*. I chose these sources to represent a wide ideological spectrum. *Macleans* and *National Post* represent a centre-to-right perspective, *CBC News* and *The Globe and Mail* represent a centre-to-left perspective, and *Global News* represents a relatively centrist perspective. A wide

ideological spectrum is desirable for my project as, in the construction of my proposal, I suspected news sources of different ideological dispositions would represent race and gender differently. This was found to generally be correct.

I chose to analyse print and digital news articles given that they are easily accessible, demonstrate a wide range of forms (editorial, opinion, facts-based reporting, etc.), and are more likely to make use of subliminal lexical choices than, say, television coverage. To conduct my research, I used the online databases *Factiva* and *Canadian Newsstream.* To access the articles I coded, I used each of the party leader's names as search keys on *Factiva* and *Canadian Newsstream*, followed by the relevant time frame and relevant sources. For sources that cannot be accessed via *Factiva* or *Canadian Newsstream,* I made use of the search function on the source's website - abiding by the criteria and selecting the available articles (excluding duplicates) produced by the search as my sample. My total sample of articles totalled 83.

Data Analysis Frameworks

Content Coding Framework

Within my quantitative content analysis, I recorded the frequency at which various frames, narratives, and lexical choices occurred in the media texts in question. To do this, I followed the coding framework developed by Dr. Erin Tolley. Tolley's framework pertains specifically to racialized mediation, and as such, I have added elements related to gendered mediation, reported speech, and other themes in the relevant literature. These are featured in Appendix A. If, during my research, I encountered prominent narratives outside those already identified in Tolley's framework, I recorded it and determined whether it fit within my existing categories. If it did not, it was included in my research analysis, and I considered it reflective of an alternatively useful framing or narrative device.

Discourse Coding Framework

In discussing critical discourse analysis, it is essential to define the components that comprised my analysis and research. The discourse strand, or the broader theme under investigation, can be identified as racialized and gendered mediation. The discourse plane, or the location from which discourses are occurring, are print and digital news articles covering key events in the 2021 Canadian federal election (Trimble & Trieberg 2015, 236). The discourse fragments, or portions of text under consideration, can be identified as the headlines and body texts of the digital and print news articles.

The coding framework I have created provides a basis upon which I abstracted from the frames, narratives, and lexical choices conveyed in the articles to broader discourses of gender, race, and leadership. The following questions were used in interpreting the latent content of the news media sources:

- What is the overall frame of the article, or its persistent organising principles that would develop conceptualizations of or reorient opinions towards the issue at hand?
- Could the narrative or frame in question be articulated neutrally? I.e., is race/gender a necessary component of the article or is it artificially injected into the narrative? If it could be articulated neutrally, does the frame in question construct a gendered and racialized understanding of the event or phenomenon being explored in the article?
- Does the narrative in question make generalisations beyond what is apparent? Does it pass judgement on the leaders' ability to hold office or their viability for political leadership, whether positive or negative?
- Does the narrative in question construct leaders as either novelties or political insiders? Is this done on the basis of gender/race, whether implicitly or explicitly?
- In the context of the article, are the racialized leaders held in contrast to the white leaders? Is the woman leader held in contrast to the male leaders (beyond what may be relevant to the event in question)?

Case Rationale

Canadian politics is a particularly interesting context in which to study gendered and racialized mediation. The politics of diversity, egalitarianism, and multiculturalism feature heavily in Canadian political discourses, although these are not necessarily reflective of reality. Women and racialized minorities continue to earn substantially less than White men (cited in Tolley 2016, 3), and racialized Canadians continue to face injustice at the hands of the police, social welfare services, and other state apparatuses. These inequalities are often obscured in light of Canada's self-proclaimed multicultural

political character. Given the role of the media as a dominant reproductor of public discourse and importance, it is essential to question how the media reflects these dynamics in its coverage of political leaders.

As discussed, leaders are becoming increasingly important in evaluating electoral choices and influencing voters at the polls (McAllister 2007, 583). What is concerning about this, however, is the way in which leaders are evaluated - they are often assessed in relation to the prototypical or 'ideal' candidate (Bittner 2010, 188), as well as in relation to each other. This gives way to potentially concerning dynamics between racialized leaders, who are perceived to challenge the status quo, and White leaders, who are perceived as the norm. Given the deeply entrenched racial dynamics present in Canada's history, there is no question that these variables must interact. The same dynamic holds true for women leaders, who continue to be underrepresented at all levels of government and are therefore also relegated to the political sidelines. Canadian politics therefore provides a peculiar and valuable context for this research.

At the time of writing, the 2021 Canadian federal election concluded around eighteen months ago. Much has changed in the Canadian political landscape since its conclusion in the fall of 2021. Discourses on race and gender are constantly changing over time, and as such, I will be adding to the extensive body of gendered mediation literature by exploring how they existed in this context. The 2021 election also provides a particularly unique context given that it is the first time Canada has seen two racialized party leaders contest a federal election. They are the first two racialized federal party leaders in Canadian political history, one of whom is the first black woman to lead a federal political party, and as such, I will be able to provide unique insights on the intersection of gendered and racialized mediation.

Conclusion

This chapter gave an overview of my theoretical background and relevant literature on gendered and racialized mediation, which will provide insight into answering my research question: How was gender and race constructed in news media coverage of the four major party leaders in the 2021 Canadian federal election, and what does this reveal about broader social discourses surrounding suitability for

political leadership? Here, I also provided a rationale for selecting the 2021 Canadian federal election as my chosen case study. Chapter Two analyses the quantitative data I collected during my coding process for each of my four chosen electoral milestones: the writ issue, major campaign announcements for each of the leaders, the English language leaders' debate, and election night. I will provide an overview of my collected data for each instance and draw conclusions on what this means for representations of race, gender, and political leadership in the media.

CHAPTER TWO

Quantitative Insights

Introduction

In this chapter, I analyse and discuss the quantitative data I collected through my coding process for each of my four chosen electoral milestones: the writ issue, major campaign announcements for each of the leaders, the English language leaders' debate, and election night.

Writ Issue

Background

After much speculation that a summer election would be called, Prime Minister Justin Trudeau met with Governor General Mary Simon on August 15, 2021 - dissolving parliament and officially issuing the writ of election (Aiello 2021). While several of the party leaders had been preparing for weeks to come - for instance, the NDP had already released a series of anticipatory platform commitments - the official writ issue marked the beginning of the campaign period and a slew of platform and policy announcements from the leaders. The campaign period was obscured by several ongoing issues of global and national importance, including the withdrawal of troops from Afghanistan (CBC News 2021) and a particularly severe wave of the COVID-19 virus, meaning news coverage of the election competed for 'airtime' with these issues. Hanging over news coverage and public sentiment was also the fact that the election was called just short of two years into Prime Minister Trudeau's second term, and the media capitalised on the voter fatigue experienced by many Canadians. This sentiment did not only extend to the public - both Jagmeet Singh and Erin O'Toole criticised Trudeau's electoral timing as unnecessary and fiscally irresponsible (Tasker 2021a) (Tasker 2021b). These issues set the stage for news coverage of the writ issue and were frequently appearing topics in coverage of all four party leaders.

Data

The quantitative coding data collected for the writ issue period (August 15 and 16, 2021) is represented as follows:

Table 1: Results of quantitative content analysis for the writ issue period.

Code	*n*	Percentage of articles containing the code (%)
Article mentions leader's gender	2	7.0
Article mentions leader's visible minority status	2	7.0
Article mentions leader's race	2	7.0
Article mentions that leader identifies with a minority religion (non-Christian)	1	3.0
Article mentions that leader speaks a minority language (language other than English or French)	0	0.0
Article mentions that leader speaks a majority language (English or French)	0	0.0
Article mentions leader is Canadian born	0	0.0
Article mentions leader's support from minority communities	2	7.0
Article mentions leader's support from mainstream communities	3	1.1
Article portrays leader as a political insider	5	18.5
Article portrays leader as a novelty	7	25.9
Article comments on quality of the leader (either positive or negative)	8	29.6
Article mentions a political or election-related poll or survey in the headline, sub-headline, or first three paragraphs	2	7.0
Article mentions a political or election-related poll or survey in the rest of the story	10	37.0
Article uses a game frame in the headline, sub-headline, or first three paragraphs	8	29.6
Article uses a game frame in the rest of the story	15	55.5
Article connects the leader to a policy issue	23	85.1
Article connects the leader to a crime/justice issue	4	14.8
Article connects the leader to a social welfare issue	10	27.0

Article connects the leader to an immigration or multiculturalism issue	3	11.1
Article connects the leader to some other policy issue (see Appendix A)	21	77.7
Article mentions the leader's family	3	11.1
Article mentions the leader's personal life	1	3.7
Article mentions the leader's appearance	1	3.7
Article mentions the leader's wardrobe	0	0
Article includes a direct quotation from the leader	21	77.7
Article includes a quotation about the leader	16	59.2
Article includes a paraphrase of something the leader has said	13	48.1
Article uses negative/aggressive speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (see Appendix A)	5	18.5
Article uses neutral speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (See Appendix A)	23	85.1
Article uses positive speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (See Appendix A)	2	7.4
Total n = 27		

Discussion

Context

An important caveat that differs coverage of the writ issue from coverage of other points in the election is that the issuing of the writ and the subsequent start of the campaign period serve mainly as a time for party leaders to introduce themselves to the public. While some party leaders began their campaigns well in advance of the writ issue, others did not - meaning the electorate had yet to be formally introduced to them and their electoral priorities. This campaign was a first for two of the four party leaders studied in this project - Erin O'Toole and Annamie Paul. Notably, neither of these leaders began releasing platform commitments or began their unofficial campaign prior to the issuing of the writ, meaning the day of the writ issue and those following served as their true introduction period. While I initially did not take this factor into consideration when forming my hypotheses, novelty-based coverage reflects the most strongly on O'Toole and Paul. While novelty coverage is a key indicator of gendered

and racialized mediation (Cameron & Shaw 2020, 151), given the circumstances, I did not consider it indicative of gendered or racialized dynamics.

Mentions of Race, Gender, and Minority/Majority Status

In this set of articles, gender was mentioned twice, visible minority status was mentioned twice, race was mentioned twice, and minority religion membership was mentioned once. As expected, all of these mentions were directed towards the two racialized candidates - Jagmeet Singh and Annamie Paul. Both mentions of gender were in relation to Paul, as were both mentions of race. Singh and Paul each received one mention of their visible minority status. Interestingly, Paul received the only mention of minority religion membership (she is Jewish), even though Singh's Sikh identity has featured heavily in his previous campaigns and his general presentation of himself as a leader (Bouchard 2021).

Whether the leader speaks a minority or majority language and whether the leader is Canadian born went unmentioned in any of the articles. While I was mostly unsurprised at the lack of mention of language or birthplace, given the general lack of focus on personal details in this sample, it is important to note that the personal details that *were* mentioned specifically related to the racialized and women candidates - namely, their visible minority status, minority religion membership, gender, and race.

Mention of support from minority communities occurred twice - once in relation to Justin Trudeau, and once in relation to Jagmeet Singh. While I assumed based on the literature that racialized candidates would be associated with support from racialized communities (Tolley 2016, 30), the opposite was true. Justin Trudeau was associated with support from racialized and 'ethnic' communities, whereas Singh's support from minority communities was discussed in the context of his 2SLGBTQ+ rights advocacy. However, Tolley also notes that racialized candidates are more likely to be associated with 'rights' issues, often to the exclusion of their hard policy stances (117). Thus, while overt racialized references may not be present in this sample, covert instances of racialized mediation remain pervasive.

Overall, however, mentions of race, gender, and minority support made up an extremely small proportion of the broader sample. This may be for several reasons. Firstly, as discussed, news coverage of

the election competed for relevance with other globally important issues, such as the withdrawal from Afghanistan and the ongoing wave of COVID-19, meaning personal details of the leaders may have been secondary considerations in the broader political context. Secondly, while the writ issue period does serve as an important time for leaders to be introduced to the public, the two racialized leaders (including the one woman leader) were of the two parties least likely to form government following the election. This may have led the minute personal characteristics of Paul and Singh to become less relevant in electoral discussions at the time.

Portrayals of Political Leadership: Novelty, Quality, Framing

Portrayals of leaders as political insiders occurred on five occasions. Three of these were in relation to Justin Trudeau and two of these were in relation to Jagmeet Singh. Both Singh and Trudeau were incumbents in this election (whereas Paul and O'Toole were not), and thus I do not consider their portrayals as political insiders to be indicative of anything deeper. Further, mentions of political insider status were roughly proportional to the volume of articles covering each leader or the mentions of each leader in the total article sample. The same is true for portrayals of leaders as political novelties - this occurred on seven occasions, six of these in relation to O'Toole and one in relation to Paul. I do not consider this indicative of any gendered or racialized dynamics for two reasons: firstly, as discussed in the previous section, Paul was incredibly unlikely to form government, whereas O'Toole was the main competitor of incumbent Prime Minister Trudeau. This means that by virtue of O'Toole's position in the race and the media's use of the game frame, O'Toole simply received more media scrutiny, and therefore, more mentions. Secondly, it is a fact that both O'Toole and Paul were the two non-incumbent leaders in this election, and portrayal of them as political novelties would merely be reflective of reality. Such portrayals were also proportional to the volume of articles covering the two leaders or their mentions in the total article sample.

Comments on leader quality occurred on eight occasions. Three of these were directed towards Trudeau, two of them towards Singh, two towards O'Toole, and one towards Paul. I did not find it

surprising that most discussions of quality were directed towards Trudeau, given that he had served a term and a half as Prime Minister, and many journalists raised the question of whether he was fit to serve a third. O'Toole and Singh had also been party leaders for one year and three years, respectively, at the time of the election, meaning enough time had passed for the media and public to form substantive critiques or praises of their leadership.

The critique of Paul's leadership focused mainly on her embroilment in the Green Party leadership crisis, wherein a Green MP crossed the floor to the Liberals following Paul's comments on Israel-Palestine, leading several senior Green Party figures to call for her resignation (Cecco 2021). Paul's handling of the comments and subsequent floor-crossing were frequently abstracted to an assessment of her performance as Green Party leader and the potential prime minister. The articles covering her implied that the leadership crisis, which in fact was largely exacerbated by Paul's staff, reflected negatively on her capability to hold the office of party leader. While critique of Paul's handling of the crisis may have been warranted, Paul certainly received the harshest scrutiny in terms of her capacity for leadership, especially given that the crisis represented her *only* transgression, in comparison to other leaders (such as Trudeau and O'Toole) who had amassed several scandals over time. Literature confirms that the news media subjects women candidates to harsher scrutiny than their male counterparts for similar or lesser transgressions (Cameron & Shaw 2020, 153), and this was certainly evidenced in this sample.

Use of the 'game frame', or the "construction of political events as strategic competition between opponents," and discussions of the 'horse race' or 'battle' between candidates reflect a masculinized version of Canadian politics (Dekavalla 2018). Given that sports and battle metaphors evoke traditionally masculine images and associations, their use in the news media links the political 'game' or 'arena' with an aggressive and masculine narrative (Gidengil & Everitt 2003a, 572). Embedded within a game frame is the frequent use of polling and opinion research to emphasise the extent of the 'horse race' and the level of sports-like competition between candidates. For the purposes of this section and those following, I will consider game frames and polling in conjunction.

Two articles had polls mentioned in their ledes, and both were in reference to Justin Trudeau. On ten occasions, a poll was mentioned in the full news article - four of these were in reference to Justin Trudeau, two of these were in relation to Jagmeet Singh, one was in reference to Erin O'Toole, and three of these were in articles that covered two or more of the leaders at once. No article referencing Annamie Paul had polling in its lede or full story. Explicit use of a game frame was a much more common occurrence - eight articles made use of a game frame in their lede, and fifteen employed a game frame in the full story. In terms of total uses of a game frame (in both the ledes and full stories), four were in reference to Singh, six were in reference to Trudeau, six were in reference to O'Toole, two were in reference to Paul, and five were in reference to several of the leaders at once.

The overwhelmingly frequent use of a game frame, in my view, reflects two main things. Firstly, the masculinization of Canadian politics remains pervasive, at least in this sample. Game frames are rife with traditionally masculine narratives, such as those of sports and warfare. Use of these narratives serves to cast women as outsiders to the political 'game', particularly by situating them in a context in which they are not traditionally welcome (Gidengil & Everitt 2003a, 574). This reifies the idea that women in politics exist as novelties and anomalies, and that politics is inherently a masculine or male-dominated space. Such dynamics serve merely to perpetuate women's underrepresentation and marginalisation in the political sphere.

Secondly, the prominence of the game frame in this sample reflects, as I have discussed previously, the introductory nature of the writ issue period. Polling and game frames likely occurred with increased frequency because the media sought to set the tone for coverage of the election - outlining who was starting the election ahead in the polls, who would be most likely to form government, who was projected to make gains or losses, and other such topics. While this explanation does not construct a gendered or racialized understanding of Canadian politics, it can exist alongside my first argument - that being, the frequency with which the game frame was used reifies the norm of masculinity in Canadian politics. While the game frame reflects the news media's aim of setting the stage for the forthcoming election, which is not in itself gendered, it can simultaneously be true that the characteristic language and

metaphors employed by the game frame constructs the Canadian political sphere as an inherently gendered space. For this reason, I consider the frequent use of the game frame suspect - but it is to be taken with some understanding of alternatively acceptable explanations.

Policy Associations

Leader-to-policy associations are an important component of gendered and racialized mediation. Literature confirms that women are often portrayed as having an exclusive interest in 'soft' policy issues, such as child, family, and other social policy (cited in Tolley 2016, 27-28), whereas racialized candidates are mainly linked to 'minority' policy issues, such as immigration, multiculturalism, crime, and minority rights (Tolley 2016, 116). The following table outlines the policy linkages made in my sample covering the writ issue period:

Table 2: Leader-to-policy associations for the writ issue period.

Policy	Justin Trudeau	Erin O'Toole	Jagmeet Singh	Annamie Paul
Economy	2	8	1	0
Energy	0	1	0	0
2SLGBTQ+ rights/issues	1	2	1	0
Healthcare (incl. Dental & pharmaceutical services)	0	2	1	0
Environment/climate change	4	5	1	1
Government	2	1	0	0
Health (COVID-19, vaccines)	10	6	0	0
Telecommunications	0	1	0	0
Jobs & Industry	1	2	0	0
Tax policy	0	2	1	0

Foreign affairs	2	2	0	0
Childcare	3	3	0	0
Crime/justice	1	1	0	1
Housing	0	2	0	1
Welfare	3	0	1	0
Indigenous rights/issues	2	0	2	1
Inequality	1	0	0	0
National defence	1	0	0	0
Immigration	1	0	0	0
Labour	0	0	1	0

I did not expect leader-to-policy associations to prove particularly significant for this sample, mainly because the time from which I drew my articles was too early for the leaders to have put forward substantive policy. Further, I suspected that the number of leader-to-policy associations would be skewed in favour of Justin Trudeau - given that he was the incumbent Prime Minister and the lack of substantial policy put forward at that point in the campaign, I suspected that the articles might rely on Trudeau's previous policy while in government, of which the other leaders had none. Indeed, the data on leader-to-policy associations in this sample produced few significant findings. However, I will discuss two aspects of the data that stood out and may offer insights into the media's implicit use of gender and race.

Firstly, only the two white male candidates (Erin O'Toole and Justin Trudeau) were linked to the issue of childcare, which is typically thought to be a 'soft' policy issue, and therefore less likely to be associated with male leaders (Tolley 2016, 27-28). I argue that this may be reflective of two things. One, childcare is increasingly being viewed by policymakers as a matter of economic efficiency. The Government of Canada website advertises its $10/day childcare program on the basis that it will help grow the economy and allow more women to enter the workforce (Employment and Social Development Canada 2022). Thus, the issue of childcare may now be seen to fall under the umbrella of 'hard' policy

issues such as the economy, which are more often associated with men. Two, it may simply be reflective

of the fact that Justin Trudeau had recently implemented a relatively popular $10/day childcare program,

and Erin O'Toole, as his strongest competitor, needed to forefront an equally viable solution to childcare.

Nonetheless, this sample demonstrates that the gendered line between 'soft' and 'hard' policy issues may

be becoming increasingly blurred - a positive sign.

Secondly, Erin O'Toole and Justin Trudeau were also the only two leaders to be associated with

any immigration or multiculturalism issues, something which Tolley notes can be a key indicator of

racialized mediation when directed towards racialized candidates (Tolley 2016, 116). Multiculturalism

was not a frequently appearing topic, however I found this occurrence to be interesting, especially given

that immigration and multiculturalism issues do not typically appear at the forefront of a candidate's

policy playbook. This may be a sign that overt instances of racialized mediation, such as ethnicized

leader-to-policy associations, are becoming less common, as I observed with regards to explicit mentions

of race, gender, and majority or minority status. While I do not take this to be conclusive, this instance

directly contradicted existing literature and my initial predictions and is therefore notable in the context of

this sample.

Family, Appearance, Personal Life

The families, appearances, and personal lives of the leaders were only brought to attention on two

occasions. Personal life was mentioned once, and appearance was mentioned once. Interestingly, both

occurrences were in reference to Erin O'Toole. While this ran contrary to my hypothesis that Annamie

Paul would experience increased personalization compared to the other leaders, it affirmed my hypothesis

that O'Toole's proximity to white hegemonic masculinity would be forefronted, and that this would

manifest itself through tactics such as the family strategy, the 'decent man' persona, and the relation of

O'Toole's body to ideals of political leadership.

As referenced in my literature review, Trimble et al. found that coverage of male candidates'

bodies is often a vehicle through which the media authenticates and reaffirms their viability for political

leadership (Trimble et al. 2015, 320). By referencing candidates' physiques and physical prowess, the media reinforces the hegemonically masculine political norm, and dismisses those who do not conform to the 'ideal' physique as lacking viability for leadership roles (320). This equates physical strength and embodiments of hegemonic masculinity with political leadership, and ultimately, the idea that to be perceived as a 'strong' leader requires a particular corporeal performance of masculinity." (Duerst-Lahti & Kelly 1995, 19; cited in Trimble et al. 2015)

The article mentioning Erin O'Toole's physique reads as follows: "The first thing that the Conservatives want you to know is that their plan is serious - 83 pages as a PDF, with tiny type but also with many pictures of Mr. O'Toole, who is looking very fit these days." (Ibbitson 2021) While rather tongue-in-cheek, the article links O'Toole's level of physical fitness with the seriousness and legitimacy of his party's platform, demonstrating the equation of physical strength or prowess with political leadership. This serves to exclude and diminish men who do not conform to such standards of masculinity as unviable for political leadership - a dynamic which emerges on both racial and gendered lines , and that further raises the bar for acceptance and success in the political sphere (Smith 2021, 3).. The reference to O'Toole's personal life explored his tenure in the Canadian Armed Forces and sought to abstract from his past in Forces to his time as leader. I did not read too deeply into this reference, especially given that one of the aims of the article was to provide an informational background on O'Toole, who at the time had not yet faced the public in a general election. However, I did find it important to note that the background focused mainly on his time in the Canadian Armed Forces, to the exclusion of other aspects of his personal life, which appeared to reify the hypermasculine nature of his past pursuits and link them with his viability for political leadership.

Reported Speech

A vast majority of the articles in this sample featured a direct quote from a leader - twenty-one, or 77.7%, of articles sampled. Of these, seven featured quotes from Justin Trudeau, seven from O'Toole, two from Jagmeet Singh, three from Annamie Paul, and two articles featured quotes from two or more of

the leaders. I do not consider these findings to be reflective of anything significant because they are

proportional to the volume of articles covering each leader or the mentions of each leader in the total

article sample. The same is true for quotations about each leader - four articles contained a quotation

about Trudeau, four about O'Toole, two for Singh, two for Paul, and four about two or more of the

leaders.

With regards to speech verbs, an overwhelming majority of the articles (twenty-three) featured

neutral speech verbs to report on the speech of the leaders. Two articles employed positive speech verbs -

one in reference to Singh and one in reference to Paul, while five employed negative speech verbs - three

in reference to Trudeau and two in reference to O'Toole. The use of negative speech verbs contradicts

existing literature - Gidengil and Everitt find that negative speech verbs appear more often in coverage of

women candidates (Gidengil & Everitt 2003c, 221). However, the pattern in this sample is clear - neutral

reporting of the leaders' speech clearly prevailed over charged language and given the biased use of

charged language in the coverage of women and racialized candidates, this represents a positive step in

how reported speech is presented to the public.

Conclusion

In this section, I reviewed the quantitative data collected from my sample of articles covering the

writ issue period between August 15, 2021 and August 16, 2021. I connected the data to existing

literature and common manifestations of gendered and racialized mediation, as outlined in my literature

review. From this process, I have derived the following conclusions about this sample:

1. Covert instances of racialized mediation remain pervasive - in particular, the disproportionate

   association of racialized candidates with minority rights-based political issues, and the

   disproportionate focus on the race or visible minority status of racialized candidates compared to

   other salient issues.

2. Personalization of the leaders was not a salient feature of this sample, but the personal details that *were* mentioned specifically related to the racialized and women candidates - namely, their visible minority status, minority religion membership, gender, and race.

3. The disproportionate use of the game frame in this sample reflects the continued construction of politics as an inherently masculine space, reifying the idea that women in politics exist as novelties.

4. Mentions of family, appearance, and personal life were used to reaffirm a hegemonically masculine concept of the 'ideal' political leader - equating physical strength and appearance with leadership capabilities. This ran contrary to my hypothesis that Annamie Paul, as a woman, would experience disproportionate personalization and scrutiny of her physical appearance, personal life, and family.

5. The speech of the leaders was reported in an overwhelmingly neutral fashion in this sample, representing a break from harmful trends in how women and racialized leaders' speech is presented to the public. Additionally, the leaders were quoted and discussed in roughly equal proportions.

6. The above conclusions must be considered in the context of the sample, namely, that the writ issue period serves as an introductory period for the candidates, that this particular writ issue occurred in the context of other important global events, and that given the timing in the campaign, sufficient time had not elapsed for leaders to present policy and therefore produce appropriate data on leader-to-policy associations.

In the next section, I will review the quantitative data drawn from articles covering major campaign announcements for each of the four leaders.

Major Campaign Announcements

<u>Background</u>

To get a more personalised account of coverage of each of the leaders, I chose to include one major campaign announcement from each of the party leaders in my final data set. This set of data represents the combined coding data from each of the leaders' respective campaign announcements. While each announcement occurred at a different time, they have been considered in conjunction for purposes of clarity and variety. To determine which campaign announcements I would use for each leader I relied on two strategies. Firstly, in my first set of data collection, I made note of which campaign announcements received significant coverage - this was done in anticipation of collecting a set of data based on major campaign announcements. Secondly, I entered the first and last names of each of the leaders plus the search term "campaign 2021 election" into *Factiva* and *Canadian Newsstream,* and examined the first two pages of results to determine which campaign announcements received the most coverage. This method of searching produced the following results:

Erin O'Toole - Gun Policy Reversal, September 5-6, 2021

At a campaign stop on September 5, 2021, Erin O'Toole announced he was reversing a major policy plank of his platform after days of scrutiny. While the Conservative platform explicitly stated that the party would reverse the Liberal-enacted ban on assault-style weapons, O'Toole reneged on that commitment, pledging to uphold the ban if elected (Major 2021). For many, this was considered a turning point in the campaign that solidified the Conservatives' place as the Official Opposition (Ljunggren 2021).

Annamie Paul - Platform Release, September 7, 2021

Compared to the other leaders, Annamie Paul had very few campaign or policy announcements. This could be owed to any number of factors, from ongoing party turmoil to the small-scale nature of the Green Party. Paul campaigned almost exclusively in her riding of Toronto Centre, leaving little room for any national-scale campaign or policy announcements (Thurton 2021). Thus, I chose to examine the

release of her platform, which comprised most of the party's campaign announcements (and campaign momentum overall).

Justin Trudeau - Platform Release, September 1, 2021

Much like the Green Party, the Liberals chose to package most of their policy announcements into the release of their platform. While the character of the several of the Liberal campaign announcements were noteworthy in themselves – and often marked by threatening behaviour and expletives from protestors - I chose to screen campaign announcements based on the quality and substance of their policy, as well as their relevance to the campaign. The combination of these factors led me to choose the Liberal's platform release in this instance.

Jagmeet Singh - Corporate Tax Loopholes, August 30, 2021

By far the most prominent campaign announcement from Singh in terms of its presence in news articles was Singh's campaign stop in Sudbury, wherein he announced his intention to crack down on corporate tax loopholes and work towards more equitable tax bracketing if elected. While this may have been a relatively minor aspect of Singh's platform, the announcement was particularly effective at solidifying Singh's brand and the general direction of his policy. By promising to stand up to corporations in the interest of everyday Canadians, Singh effectively used this campaign announcement to project an image of working-class solidarity.

Data

The quantitative coding data collected for major campaign announcements (various dates) is represented as follows:

Table 3: Results of quantitative content analysis for major campaign announcements for each leader.

Code	n	Percentage of articles

		containing the code (%)
Article mentions leader's gender	2	9.5
Article mentions leader's visible minority status	0	0
Article mentions leader's race	0	0
Article mentions that leader identifies with a minority religion (non-Christian)	0	0
Article mentions that leader speaks a minority language (language other than English or French)	0	0
Article mentions that leader speaks a majority language (English or French)	0	0
Article mentions leader is Canadian born	0	0
Article mentions leader's support from minority communities	1	0
Article mentions leader's support from mainstream communities	2	9.5
Article portrays leader as a political insider	1	4.8
Article portrays leader as a novelty	4	19.0
Article comments on quality of the leader (either positive or negative)	8	38.0
Article mentions a political or election-related poll or survey in the headline, sub-headline, or first three paragraphs	1	4.8
Article mentions a political or election-related poll or survey in the rest of the story	4	19.0
Article uses a game frame in the headline, sub-headline, or first three paragraphs	4	19.0
Article uses a game frame in the rest of the story	8	38.0
Article connects the leader to a policy issue	20	95.2
Article connects the leader to a crime/justice issue	10	47.6
Article connects the leader to a social welfare issue	11	55
Article connects the leader to an immigration or multiculturalism issue	2	9.5
Article connects the leader to some other policy issue (see Appendix A)	14	66.7
Article mentions the leader's family	0	0
Article mentions the leader's personal life	0	0
Article mentions the leader's appearance	2	9.5

Article mentions the leader's wardrobe	0	0
Article includes a direct quotation from the leader	14	66.7
Article includes a quotation about the leader	13	61.9
Article includes a paraphrase of something the leader has said	14	66.7
Article uses negative/aggressive speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (see Appendix A)	6	28.6
Article uses neutral speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (See Appendix A)	18	90.0
Article uses positive speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (See Appendix A)	1	4.8
Total n = 21		

Discussion

Mentions of Race, Gender, and Minority/Majority Status

In this set of articles, gender was mentioned twice. Once was in relation to Annamie Paul, and once was in relation to Erin O'Toole. It is consistent with my hypotheses that Annamie Paul's gender was highlighted, particularly as it was not relevant to the release of her platform. Clearly, then, gendered mediation remains relevant in this sample. However, what is also clearly relevant is masculinized mediation, something that was observed on several occasions in my sample of articles covering the writ issue. What is notable about this observation is the difference in content between O'Toole and Paul's respective campaign announcements. While the articles covering Paul looked at the release of her entire platform, O'Toole's campaign announcement focused specifically on guns - an issue that is seen to be emblematic of hegemonic masculinity (Neville-Shepard & Kelly 2020). Mentions of O'Toole's masculinity in the context of this announcement raise questions about *why* reporters chose to forefront his gender in this instance.

Mentions of support from minority communities occurred on one occasion, in reference to Justin Trudeau. Mentions of support from mainstream communities occurred on two occasions; once in reference to Jagmeet Singh, and once in reference to Annamie Paul. This directly contradicts existing

literature as Tolley finds that racialized candidates are more likely to be associated with support from racial minority communities, or minority communities overall (Tolley 2016, 30). This may be a positive step in terms of how racialized candidates are presented by the media to the public. Rather than linking them exclusively with 'minority' issues, it is clear in this sample that Singh and Paul were put on equal footing with O'Toole and Trudeau in that they were portrayed as appealing to mainstream voters.

Portrayals of Political Leadership: Novelty, Quality, Framing

Only one article portrayed any of the leaders as a political insider, and this was directed towards Justin Trudeau. Because Trudeau's political experience is factual and reflective of reality, given that he was seeking a third term in office, I do not consider this reflective of anything broader.

Leaders were portrayed as novelties on four occasions. Three were in relation to O'Toole and one was in relation to Paul. As was evident in the previous sample, this must be considered against a variety of factors. First, while it appears that O'Toole received more coverage in general for this variable (even when the proportion of articles each leader occupied in the sample is considered), it is true that Paul was unlikely to form government whereas O'Toole was the main competitor of incumbent Trudeau. Thus, once again, O'Toole may have received more coverage by virtue of his position in the race; he simply received more media scrutiny, and therefore, more mentions. Secondly, as I mentioned in the previous section, both O'Toole and Paul were the only non-incumbent leaders in this election, so any portrayal of them as political novelties would merely be reflective of reality.

While the previous sample overwhelmingly featured a game frame, fewer than half of articles in this sample employed a game frame in their full story, with even fewer employing one in their lede or headline. I found this to be notable given my previous observation that the game frame was a main vehicle through which gendered mediation took place. Polling, which I have chosen to consider in conjunction with the game frame due to its role in emphasising the 'horse race' between candidates, also did not feature heavily in this sample. Since this sample focused on articles covering individual leaders making policy announcements on their campaign stops, articles that positioned the leaders against each

other would be more likely to detract from the stories at hand, so it is not entirely unsurprising that polling and the game frame did not feature prominently here. However, for the articles that did use polling or a game frame, both in their lede and the full story, they were exclusively used in reference to the three male leaders. This is notable given the tendency of the game frame to reify the idea of the political sphere as a solely masculine space using sports or wartime metaphors (Gidengil & Everitt 2003a, 574). Thus, while the extent of the game frame's use in this sample is significantly smaller, the use of the game frame to position the three male candidates against each other in the 'horse race' - to the exclusion of the woman candidate - represents a continuation of gendered political dynamics.

Policy Associations

For this sample I have chosen not to conduct an analysis of leader-to-policy associations. The main reason for this is because I have narrowed the sample down to include policy or campaign announcements for each of the individual leaders. As a result, if the announcement in question had to do with a specific policy, it would skew the data in favour of that association. For instance, since the announcement I chose for Jagmeet Singh had to do with tax policy, he was disproportionately associated with tax policy compared to the other leaders, but it would be flawed to abstract this outside of the narrow focus of his announcement. The announcements I chose for each leader were determined solely through the volume of news coverage they received, and therefore might not be reflective of the leader's broader campaign or the leader-to-policy associations they received on all other occasions.

Family, Appearance, Personal Life

The appearances of the leaders were only brought to attention on two occasions, while the families and personal lives of the leaders were not mentioned at all. Consistent with the previous section, both mentions of appearance were in reference to Erin O'Toole. The two references each focused on O'Toole's physical demeanour - smiling, energetic, put-together - otherwise known as the 'decent man' persona, associated with cheerful yet headstrong representations of masculinity (Smith 2021, 3). While

this challenges my expectation that Annamie Paul would experience increased personalization compared to the other leaders, it affirmed my proposition that O'Toole's proximity to white hegemonic masculinity would be foregrounded, and that this would manifest itself through tactics such as the family strategy, the 'decent man' persona, and the relation of O'Toole's body to ideals of political leadership. The emphasis of O'Toole's appearance and masculinity (to the exclusion of those of the other male candidates) remains a persistent theme throughout my samples and offers important insights into the media's valorisation of traditional standards of masculinity.

Reported Speech

Most articles in this sample either included a direct quotation from a leader, a quotation about a leader, or a paraphrase of something said by the leader. Of direct quotes, four were from Erin O'Toole, four were from Justin Trudeau, four were from Jagmeet Singh, and two were from Annamie Paul. This is roughly proportional to the number of articles in the sample covering each leader; six covered O'Toole, six covered Trudeau, five covered Singh, and four covered Paul. Using these numbers, one can conclude that Singh was quoted at a slightly higher rate compared to the other leaders, whereas Paul was quoted at a slightly lower rate, however, the gap between Paul and Singh's quotes vs. their appearance in the sample is not large enough to draw any substantial conclusions.

Of quotations about a leader, five were about O'Toole, three were about Trudeau, four were about Singh, and one was about Paul. Compared to the proportion of articles each leader occupied in the sample, quotations about O'Toole and Singh appeared at a disproportionately higher rate, whereas quotations about Paul and Trudeau appeared at a disproportionately lower rate. I originally hypothesised that Singh and Paul would appear more often as the object of reported speech rather than the subject (see: H4). This sample challenges this hypothesis on both front. While Singh was featured in quotations about the leader (as the object) at a slightly higher rate compared to his presence in the sample, he was also the subject or speaker of a quote at a higher rate compared to his presence in the sample. Additionally, Paul was both the subject and the object of speech at a proportionally lower rate compared to the other leaders

and her appearance in the sample. Thus, one can conclude that while no consistent patterns emerged, the racialized leaders were not held in contrast to the White leaders with regards to their representation in reported speech.

As with the previous sample, neutral reporting of candidates' speech prevailed over more polarising language. The vast majority of the articles made use of neutral speech verbs in their reporting of candidates' speech. With regards to negative speech verbs, out of the six instances in which they were employed, three were directed towards O'Toole, two were directed towards Trudeau, and one was directed towards Singh. This is roughly proportional to the proportion of articles occupied by each leader in the sample, and therefore no conclusions of note can be drawn. In terms of positive speech verbs, the one instance in which they occurred was in reference to O'Toole. Positive verbal processes can be defined as those which "somehow promote in the reader a feeling that the person whose words are being reported is wise, authoritative… or in some other sense positive" (Chen 2005, 39). Because there are no uses of positive speech verbs in reference to any other candidate, I do not consider this to be reflective of anything broader.

Conclusion

In this section, I reviewed the quantitative data collected for my sample of articles covering major campaign announcements for each of the leaders. I then connected this data to concepts explored in my literature review. This has led me to the following conclusions:

1. Covert instances of gendered mediation continued to feature in this sample. In particular, the emphasis on Paul's womanhood to the exclusion of other aspects of her campaign, as well as the continued foregrounding of O'Toole's traditionally masculine characteristics remained prominent features. Racialized mediation was less pervasive, with coverage of Paul and Singh continuing to contradict propositions in existing literature. Paul and Singh were both portrayed as appealing to mainstream communities, and they were not ostracised in the sample compared to Trudeau and O'Toole.

2.   This sample did not overwhelmingly comment on the leaders' quality, novelty, or lack thereof. When comments were made to this end, they were reflective of reality and did not reveal any underlying gendered or racialized dynamics.

3.   While the use of the game frame was considerably less prominent than in the previous sample, the context in which it *was* employed demonstrated that gendered mediation remained pervasive. The game frame was used to reinforce the idea that politics is a 'man's game,' and served to pit the three male candidates against each other while erasing Paul altogether.

4.   Mentions of family, appearance, and personal life were once again used to reaffirm a hegemonically masculine concept of the 'ideal' political leader, employing the 'decent man' trope to portray O'Toole's capacity for political leadership. This ran contrary to my hypothesis that Annamie Paul would experience disproportionate personalization and scrutiny of her physical appearance, personal life, and family.

5.   The speech of the leaders remained overwhelmingly neutral, representing a continued break from harmful trends in how women and racialized leaders' speech is presented to the public. The racialized leaders were quoted directly in higher proportions compared to the white leaders and were the subject (rather than object) of reported speech in higher proportions. This challenges both my hypothesis and the findings of existing research, and likely represents a positive trend in breaking from gendered and racialized dynamics in reported speech.

In the next section, I will review quantitative data drawn from articles covering the English-language leaders' debate.

Leaders' Debate

<u>Background</u>

This section reviews news coverage of the English-language leaders' debate, which was held on the evening of September 9, 2021. The debate was the last of three held for the leaders, with the first two

being held in French. I have chosen to only review coverage of the English-language debate for two reasons. Firstly, because my study only uses English-language media, the English debate was likely to receive more coverage among English outlets. It also likely drew the most viewership and attention overall, given that the majority of Canada is Anglophone. Secondly, because an essential component of my study includes quotations and reported speech, restricting my sample to the English-language debate evades any issues surrounding translation or lack of quotation in French.

While leaders' debates themselves bear little weight on electoral outcomes (Lang 2021), coverage of the debates provides an important venue through which mediation of candidates can be studied. Coverage of leaders' debates relies almost entirely on reported speech, as the news media seeks to recount the events of the debate through quoting and paraphrasing. This can have significant implications for gendered and racialized mediation, Gidengil and Everitt find that neutral speech verbs are used significantly less often in reporting women's speech, and that usage of negative verbs occurs more often in coverage of women candidates. (Gidengil & Everitt 2003c, 221). Coverage of leaders' debates also frequently employs metaphors relating to warfare, such as describing the leaders' behaviour as "on the offensive", "attacked on all fronts", or "under fire from all sides" (Gidengil & Everitt 2003a, 568). Other common narratives and metaphors included those related to sports and games or general violence, reflecting a tendency on the part of the news media to resort to reification of the masculine political norm. These metaphors serve to cast women candidates as outsiders to the political game, both by situating them in a context in which they are not welcome and painting their behaviour as transgressive or overly aggressive (574).

Through my literature review, I surmised that visible minority candidates would be racialized through reported speech and leaders' debate coverage through the same mechanisms by which women candidates are gendered, although the effect would likely be lessened for Jagmeet Singh given that he is a man. I also expected Annamie Paul to be gendered and painted as an 'outsider' in the debate due to her status as a woman. This section reviews news coverage of the leaders' debates to provide greater insight into these expectations.

Data

The quantitative coding data collected for the English-language leaders' debate is represented as

follows:

Table 4: Results of quantitative content analysis for coverage of the English-language leaders' debate.

Code	*n*	Percentage of articles containing the code (%)
Article mentions leader's gender	9	52.9
Article mentions leader's visible minority status	2	11.7
Article mentions leader's race	2	11.7
Article mentions that leader identifies with a minority religion (non-Christian)	2	11.7
Article mentions that leader speaks a minority language (language other than English or French)	0	0
Article mentions that leader speaks a majority language (English or French)	0	0
Article mentions leader is Canadian born	0	0
Article mentions leader's support from minority communities	5	29.4
Article mentions leader's support from mainstream communities	0	0
Article portrays leader as a political insider	5	29.4
Article portrays leader as a novelty	5	29.4
Article comments on quality of the leader (either positive or negative)	9	52.9
Article mentions a political or election-related poll or survey in the headline, sub-headline, or first three paragraphs	1	5.8
Article mentions a political or election-related poll or survey in the rest of the story	7	41.2
Article uses a game frame in the headline, sub-headline, or first three paragraphs	13	76.5
Article uses a game frame in the rest of the story	15	88.2
Article connects the leader to a policy issue	14	82.4

Article connects the leader to a crime/justice issue	1	5.8
Article connects the leader to a social welfare issue	1	5.8
Article connects the leader to an immigration or multiculturalism issue	4	23.5
Article connects the leader to some other policy issue (see Appendix A)	15	88.2
Article mentions the leader's family	1	5.8
Article mentions the leader's personal life	2	11.7
Article mentions the leader's appearance	3	17.6
Article mentions the leader's wardrobe	0	0
Article includes a direct quotation from the leader	14	82.3
Article includes a quotation about the leader	4	23.5
Article includes a paraphrase of something the leader has said	15	88.2
Article uses negative/aggressive speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (see Appendix A)	17	100
Article uses neutral speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (See Appendix A)	16	94.1
Article uses positive speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (See Appendix A)	2	11.7
Total n = 17		

Discussion

Mentions of Race, Gender, and Minority/Majority Status

Out of all the samples, mentions of race, gender, and majority or minority status featured most heavily in coverage of the leaders' debate. The gendered and racialized coverage received by the candidates during the leaders' debate proves glaringly that gendered and racialized mediation in Canadian political media is alive and well. News coverage of the English-language debate painted a highly gendered and racialized picture of Canadian politics, the ideal political leader, and the 'place' of White and minority candidates within the Canadian political sphere. Nowhere was this more evident than in the volume and nature of reporting on the candidates' race, gender, and majority or minority status.

More than half of the articles referenced the gender of one or more of the candidates. Out of these nine references, seven of them were directed towards Annamie Paul, one was in reference to Erin O'Toole, and one was in reference to Justin Trudeau. The way in which the news media framed the gender of both the male and female candidates was particularly ludicrous in this sample. Beginning with Annamie Paul, references to her gender were made almost exclusively to single her out among the male candidates and contrast her 'type' of politics with those of the men. Many articles used phrases such as " [Paul] was the only woman on the stage," or referenced her to be the only Black Jewish woman to be leading a party (Kirkup, Walsh, & Stone 2021; Walsh, Curry, & Stone 2021). These types of references, particularly when they lack context, served to pit Paul against the male candidates, situating her as an outsider to the political norm. They also represent one component of a broader theme found throughout this sample, which was that Paul was framed as the designated advocate or 'spokesperson' for women's issues or racialized issues, to the exclusion of other candidates. This will be elaborated further as part of the discussion on leader-to-policy associations.

While Paul received the brunt of the gendered coverage, the male leaders certainly did not escape scot-free, as the mentions of O'Toole and Trudeau's gender were used specifically to uplift O'Toole and degrade Trudeau. The article containing these mentions denigrated Trudeau's record in office by summing him up as nothing more than a "pretty boy", using his supposed lack of masculinity to infer an absence of political leadership (Francis 2021). The author then chose to praise O'Toole not based on his policy or platform commitments, but on the fact that he had worked hard in his pre-political life, served in the military, and put himself through law school (Francis 2021). This dynamic represents the valorisation of traditional standards of masculinity, particularly those that reflect the 'decent man' persona. While in the previous samples, this dynamic existed independently of commentary on other manifestations of masculinity, the use of this trope in direct contrast to Trudeau's pretty-boy image demonstrates the tendency of the media to uplift traditional and hegemonic masculinity while condemning those who do not conform to it. This also confirms an association between political leadership and hegemonic

masculinity on the part of the news media, something which has been documented in the previous two samples.

Mentions of race, visible minority status, and minority religion status were all directed towards Paul. This is noteworthy because Jagmeet Singh fits into all three of these categories - he is racialized, a member of a visible minority group, and a member of a minority religion. He is also arguably much more popular and well-known among Canadians compared to Paul, and he has been incredibly outspoken about issues of race and his experiences as a racialized party leader. Despite all these factors, only Paul received coverage regarding her race and minority status. While this certainly indicates that gendered and racialized mediation remain prevalent, what it also proves is that gendered and racialized mediation can intersect, which is something I predicted would occur based on my literature review. Kimberle Crenshaw's theory of intersectionality posits that race and sex discrimination cannot be viewed unidirectionally as they can and will intersect to produce unique forms of discrimination for Black or racialized women (Crenshaw 1989, 149). Paul's unique experience with gendered and racialized mediation, particularly as they intersect in this sample, can therefore be viewed to arise from her status as a Black woman, and cannot be viewed through racialized and gendered mediation lenses independently.

Lastly, support from minority communities was mentioned in just under one-third of the articles. Out of the five references to support from minority communities, three were directed at Paul, one was directed at Singh, and one was directed at O'Toole. While the two previous samples contradicted existing literature on minority candidates and their association with support from minority groups, the data from this sample is supportive of Tolley's claim that racialized mediation often occurs through explicit racial content, such as through associating racialized candidates with interest in 'minority issues' or support from minority communities (Tolley 2016, 30). While Paul again experienced the brunt of this coverage, reflecting her unique experiences with gendered and racialized mediation, Singh was also drawn into this frame, reflecting existing findings on racialized mediation more broadly.

Portrayals of Political Leadership: Novelty, Quality, Framing

While five articles made mention of a leader as a political insider, all of these were directed towards Justin Trudeau. Given that Trudeau was seeking a third term in office, it is unsurprising that he was framed as an insider to Canadian politics, particularly given his long political tenure and family history. The debate was also a forum for the other candidates to critique Trudeau's existing record in office. For these reasons, I did not consider this reflective of anything broader.

Five articles also referred to leaders as novelties, three in reference to O'Toole, and two in reference to Paul. Here, I will reiterate my claim made in the previous two samples that both leaders were new to the political scene, and coverage of them as novelties would merely be reflective of reality. Additionally, because the novelty narrative did not appear frequently, nor did it appear disproportionately for either of the two candidates, I do not consider it suspect.

More than half of the articles passed judgement on the quality of the leaders, both positively and negatively. All of these were in reference to either Trudeau or O'Toole. I did not consider this dynamic to be reflective of broader meanings. As mentioned, Trudeau had an existing record as Prime Minister which the other candidates sought to critique during the debate. The leaders' debate acts as a forum through which the leaders can not only criticise the existing administration, but also present their vision as to why they might be the best Prime Minister. This inevitably reflects within the news media; particularly as certain publications choose to endorse a given candidate. Thus, given these factors, commentary on the quality of the Prime Minister, as well as commentary on the candidate most likely to unseat him (O'Toole) is unsurprising. Commentary on the two leaders' quality was not overwhelmingly positive or negative. While both positive and negative commentary featured, neither narrative dominated.

The game frame dominated coverage of the leaders' debate, more so than it did for previous samples, including the writ issue. More than 75% of the articles included a game frame either in their lede or the article body. As I have discussed previously, the game frame is a key vehicle through which gendered mediation is perpetrated. This was certainly the case in this sample, although the use of the game frame differed slightly. While in the writ issue period the game frame was used to portray a 'horse-race' between candidates, in the leaders' debate it was used to portray an outright battle between the

leaders by declaring a winner and loser at the debate's conclusion. Gidengil and Everitt have found that sports and game metaphors used in leaders' debates reflect a masculinized narrative. The use of war or sports metaphors cast women as outsiders to politics, situating them in an unfamiliar context and reifying the hypermasculine nature of the battle for political success (Gidengil & Everitt 2003a, 574). Language used in this sample, such as describing how the leaders "took shots" at each other, "pushed for a knockout moment," or attempted an "offensive play" certainly reinforced this dynamic, and served to paint the debate stage as a forum where the male candidates could 'fight it out' (Boynton & Lao 2021; Ibbitson 2021). Not only does this reinforce the political sphere as a place where masculine behaviours are normalised, it also excludes women from the political norm, or at least the norms of the debate stage. This represents a clear continuation of gendered mediation practises on the part of the news media.

However, while it is important to consider the ramifications of an overwhelming game frame narrative in terms of gendered and racialized mediation, it is also necessary to acknowledge the context behind the increased use of the game frame in this sample. Leaders' debates are, by nature, adversarial, and they provide an opportunity for leaders to go head-to-head with each other on policy issues of the day. Indeed, this specific leaders' debate was formatted such that leaders could choose to individually debate each other on certain issues, demonstrating a clear intent on behalf of the debate organisers to craft opportunities for the leaders to clash. It is unsurprising, therefore, that the news media's coverage of the debate reflected this adversarial format. The media's characterization of the debate as an outright battle between leaders was, in a sense, reflective of reality. However, there are effective ways in which journalists can reinforce the adversarial nature of the debate without resorting to long-studied tropes that facilitate the exclusion of women from politics. Avoiding warfare or sports metaphors is an obvious choice, as is refraining from pitting the women or racialized leaders against the male and white leaders on certain issues. What is ultimately being critiqued is the ways in which the game frame was employed, not the fact that it was employed at all.

Polling did not feature heavily in this sample. When it was used, it served to reinforce the game frame narrative by extrapolating from the leaders' debate performance to how they were faring electorally

at the time. Because the use of polling did not dominate this sample, I do not consider it reflective of gendered or racialized mediation, particularly given the prominence and meaning of the game frame.

Policy Associations

   The following table outlines the leader-to-policy associations found in this sample:

Table 5: Leader-to-policy associations for the leaders' debate.

Policy	Justin Trudeau	Erin O'Toole	Jagmeet Singh	Annamie Paul
Economy	0	2	0	0
Energy	0	0	0	0
2SLGBTQ+ rights/issues	0	3	0	0
Healthcare (incl. Dental & pharmaceutical services)	4	0	0	0
Environment/climate change	10	0	3	1
Government	0	1	0	0
Health (COVID-19, vaccines)	1	0	0	0
Telecommunications	0	0	0	0
Jobs & Industry	0	0	0	0
Tax policy	0	0	0	0
Foreign affairs	2	5	0	0
Childcare	0	1	0	0
Crime/justice	1	1	0	0
Housing	0	0	0	0
Welfare	1	0	0	0
Indigenous rights/issues	1	3	4	0

Inequality	1	1	1	11
National defence	0	0	0	0
Immigration	0	0	0	0
Labour	0	0	0	0

There are several interesting components of the leader-to-policy associations in this sample and I will discuss them as follows. Firstly, I will return to the issue of minority rights and their association with the various demographic of candidates. In this sample, only Erin O'Toole was associated with 2SLGBTQ+ rights issues, which contradicts existing literature on the increased likelihood of racialized candidates to be associated with 'minority issues.' This does not hold true, however, for inequality and Indigenous rights issues. While O'Toole, Singh, and Trudeau were associated at least once with Indigenous rights issues, Singh received the most frequent association with Indigenous rights. This is not entirely surprising given his party's commitment to Indigenous rights and reconciliation, although it is notable that he received more associations with Indigenous rights issues compared to any other policy, whereas the other two leaders were associated much more frequently with other issues.

The most glaring issue, however, lies in the code for 'inequality,' which I coded based on mentions of gender and racial inequality issues. While the three male leaders received no association with inequality whatsoever, Annamie Paul was associated with inequality *eleven times* - more than any other leader was associated with any other policy issue. Aside from one association with climate change policy, this was the only policy issue Annamie Paul was associated with *at all.* This is particularly ludicrous given that Paul was leading the only federal party with a mandate explicitly dedicated to environmental and climate change issues, and not to gender or racial minority rights. This issue ties back into a phenomenon I referenced under my discussion on gender, race, and minority status, wherein Paul was framed as the dedicated 'spokesperson' or advocate for gender and racial minority rights, to the exclusion of other candidates. While issues of gender and racial equality are something that should be addressed by all candidates regardless of demographic, these issues were framed by the news media to be the exclusive

jurisdiction of Paul, who is both racialized and a woman. Paul was framed as responsible for 'educating' Bloc Quebecois leader Yves-Francois Blanchet on issues of racial discrimination, for lambasting Trudeau on sexual assault in the military, and for bringing a new brand of politics to the Canadian table, ostensibly one that is less white and male. While these are all laudable and necessary goals, it is questionable why the news media chose to select Paul as the representative on these issues, despite the fact that they were broader topics of discussion throughout the debate. These issues were also not associated with Singh, even though he is also a racialized minority and member of a minority religious group.

I argue that this dynamic is representative of an intersection of gendered and racialized mediation, which serves to cast Paul as the greatest outsider in relation to the other candidates. As previously discussed, in this sample, Paul was subject to a unique form of gendered and racialized mediation, which arises out of an intersection between the two. This falls in line with Crenshaw's theory of intersectionality, which posits that racialized women experience unique forms of oppression and discrimination arising from multiple disadvantaged identities. Paul is framed as the advocate, spokesperson, or representative of these issues particularly because she is a racialized woman. While Singh is also racialized, he benefits from his male status, and is grouped in with the other male candidates in terms of their lack of commentary on women's rights issues. Because Paul experiences multiple marginalised identities, she is framed as the representative for *all* minority issues, even though commentary on these issues from all candidates would likely make greater progress on these issues altogether.

It is also notable that the two white male candidates (O'Toole and Trudeau) were associated much more frequently with 'hard' policy issues such as the economy and foreign affairs. Out of all the candidates, only O'Toole was associated with the economy at all, and this occurred on two occasions. Additionally, only Trudeau and O'Toole were associated with foreign affairs, with Trudeau receiving two associations and O'Toole receiving five. While this must be placed in context, as these are major campaign issues and only O'Toole and Trudeau were likely to form government and therefore act on these commitments, all national-level parties have major planks of their platforms dedicated to these

issues, and because they are of such great national importance, all leaders discussed them to some degree during the debate. Thus, the fact that only O'Toole and Trudeau's stances on hard policy issues received coverage by the news media indicates a degree of implicit linkage between the white male candidates and hard policy issues overall. While I am hesitant to declare this as an outright instance of gendered and racialized mediation, the lack of attention paid to the racialized candidates' position on foreign affairs and the economy (which certainly exist and were certainly mentioned during the debate) is suspect.

Lastly, it is notable that Trudeau received a total of ten associations with climate change, whereas O'Toole received none, Singh received three, and Paul received one. This is likely the case because Trudeau's existing record in government was heavily focused on climate issues and often drew controversy for its actions on climate change, but it is especially interesting when contrasted against the lack of associations for Paul given the mandate of her party. I argue that the lack of attention paid to Paul's stance on climate issues despite her party's mandate is due to her experience with intersecting gendered and racialized mediation. Because she was the only racialized woman among the candidates, these issues took precedence over other (and perhaps more relevant) policy stances. Tolley's finding that for racialized candidates, association with 'minority issues' often takes precedence over other policy issues, including the hard policy stances of candidates, is certainly relevant here (Tolley 2016, 117). Paul's extensive association with minority issues overshadowed anything she may have had to say about climate change, or really any other issue, due to her framing as the 'spokesperson' for minority issues throughout the debate. Thus, while Trudeau's over-association with climate change is understandable given his existing tenure in government, perhaps what is more relevant in this sample is the lack of mentions for Paul in this category, which provides insight into how racialized candidates interact with and are framed by the news media.

Family, Appearance, Personal Life

The leaders' families were mentioned one time, in relation to Annamie Paul. The personal lives of the leaders were mentioned twice, once about Paul and once about O'Toole. Lastly, the appearances of

the leaders were mentioned three times, twice in reference to Paul and once in reference to O'Toole. This dynamic of Paul and O'Toole experiencing disproportionate personalization compared to the other leaders remains consistent and was present in the previous two samples. While I have delved deeper into this phenomenon in the previous two sections, I will reiterate my claim here: the personalization of Paul and O'Toole to the exclusion of the other leaders reflects two dynamics. Firstly, it reflects a continuation of gendered dynamics wherein the personal lives, families, and appearances of women candidates are scrutinised to a greater degree than their male counterparts. This was a component of my original hypotheses, and this sample clearly adds support to this prediction. Secondly, it reflects a greater trend throughout the samples, which is the valorisation of traditional masculinity and the 'decent man' persona. In this sample, O'Toole's personal life and appearance were highlighted to reinforce his proximity to hegemonic masculinity. The articles highlighted his traditional, fatherly appearance, something which could connect with average Canadians, and framed him as an everyday man who had worked hard to get himself to his current position. Each of these frames were used to uplift O'Toole and frame him in a positive light, reflecting a continued tendency of the news media to glorify and prioritise hegemonic masculinity as an ideal for political leadership.

Reported Speech

Reported speech in this sample was overwhelmingly negative. All articles in this sample employed negative speech verbs to report on what the candidates had said, whereas only 94% used neutral speech verbs. This is contrasted with the previous two samples, wherein negative coverage occurred in less than 30% of the articles. While negative coverage dominated coverage of the debate, what is somewhat reassuring is that it was distributed equally among the candidates. Except for two, every single article in this sample reported the speech of all four of the candidates and used negative speech verbs to describe each of them at equal proportions. Thus, the fact that negative speech verbs outpaced neutral coverage of the candidates is more revealing about the nature of leaders' debates themselves than it is about gendered and racialized mediation. In previous leaders' debates, such as in the

1995 election, verbs used to report women's speech were twice as likely to appear among the 25 most negatively rated speech verbs, and this figure increased to three times as likely in the 1997 election (Gidengil & Everitt 2003c, 222), As my data demonstrates, this dynamic has evidently changed. It cannot necessarily be said to be positive, as the extent to which negative reporting on speech dominates has increased, but it is worth noting that racial and gender gaps in *who* receives negative speech coverage have certainly decreased.

Conclusion

In this section, I reviewed the quantitative data collected for my sample of articles covering the English-language leaders' debate and connected it to concepts explored in my literature review. This has led me to draw several conclusions about this sample and gendered or racialized mediation more broadly, and they are as follows:

1. Gendered and racialized mediation was extremely prominent in this sample. Annamie Paul was singled out for her race, gender, and religious affiliation, to the exclusion of other candidates, including the other racialized and minority religion candidate. O'Toole and Trudeau's gender was also highlighted to uplift the former and denigrate the latter, demonstrating a continued tendency on the part of the news media to valorise those who conform to hegemonic standards of masculinity.

2. The game frame dominated coverage of this sample, which served as a vehicle through which gendered and racialized mediation was perpetrated. While this was consistent with previous samples, the game frame was utilised to paint a picture of a 'battle' between candidates rather than a 'horse-race,' and the excessive use of war and sports metaphors served to cast Paul as an outsider to the 'battle' environment. However, this must be considered in the context of the adversarial nature of the debates themselves.

3. Leader-to-policy associations were also a key vehicle through which gendered and racialized mediation was advanced. Annamie Paul was associated with gender and racial inequality issues

more than any other leader was associated with any other issue, and to the exclusion of other policy considerations (which certainly existed). Ultimately, the media used Paul as a 'spokesperson' or advocate for racial and gender inequality, despite the benefit that could come from having these discussions among all candidates. The racialized candidates were also not associated with 'hard' policy issues at all - these were the exclusive domain of the white male candidates - even though these issues were discussed by all candidates during the debate.

4. Annamie Paul and Erin O'Toole experienced disproportionate scrutiny of their families, appearances, and personal lives compared to the other candidates. This is reflective of gendered mediation in two senses: firstly, that women candidates are more likely to experience personalization at the hands of the news media; and secondly, that the media tends to valorise the 'decent man' persona or other relations to hegemonic masculinity.

5. Negative reporting of speech dominated this sample, to the extent that it overtook neutral reporting of the candidates' speech. While racial and gendered gaps in terms of *who* receives negative speech coverage were not evident, which represents progress in this realm, the sheer volume of negative coverage was concerning. However, this may again reflect the adversarial nature of the leaders' debates themselves.

In my final section on quantitative data, I will review the data collected from articles covering the night of the election, and the final election results.

Election Night

<u>Background</u>

This section reviews news coverage of the night of the election's conclusion, on September 20, 2021. The results of the election returned a Parliament that was relatively unchanged compared to the last, leading many to echo their earlier concerns about the necessity of the election altogether. With regards to each of the leaders, Justin Trudeau's Liberals finished with 160 seats (an increase of 5), Erin O'Toole's

Conservatives finished with 119 seats (no change), Jagmeet Singh's NDP finished with 25 seats (an increase of 1), and Annamie Paul's Greens finished with 2 seats (no change), although Paul failed to win her own election in the riding of Toronto Centre (Simon Fraser University 2021). No leader resigned their post immediately upon the conclusion of the election, although Paul and O'Toole would go on to resign and be ousted by their party (respectively) in later months.

Post-election opinions among the public and political onlookers were mixed. While some praised O'Toole for holding Trudeau to a minority government in a time where voter apathy ran rampant, others lambasted him for failing to overtake Trudeau at what could have been an opportune moment and for reneging on certain platform commitments throughout the campaign. Public opinion on Prime Minister Trudeau himself was also divided, as his governing party once again lost in the popular vote to the Conservatives and Trudeau's public image became increasingly embattled as the pandemic and other social tensions waged on. Singh was able to emerge from the election relatively unscathed despite not making considerable gains for his party in Parliament. Lastly, the percentage of the Greens' popular vote decreased considerably under Paul (from 6.55% to 2.33%), and while many praised her political approach and vision for politics during the campaign, her poor electoral showing and infighting with the party apparatus continued to follow her after the election.

The aim of this final sample is mainly to review how the news media may have employed gender and race to assess the leadership of the candidates after the election's conclusion. News coverage in this sample includes a look back at the election, and a review of how each of the individual candidates performed and demonstrated political leadership throughout the campaign.

Data

The quantitative coding data collected for coverage of the night of the election is represented as follows:

Table 6: Results of quantitative content analysis for coverage of election night.

Code	n	Percentage of articles containing the code (%)
Article mentions leader's gender	0	0
Article mentions leader's visible minority status	0	0
Article mentions leader's race	0	0
Article mentions that leader identifies with a minority religion (non-Christian)	0	0
Article mentions that leader speaks a minority language (language other than English or French)	0	0
Article mentions that leader speaks a majority language (English or French)	0	0
Article mentions leader is Canadian born	0	0
Article mentions leader's support from minority communities	1	5.5
Article mentions leader's support from mainstream communities	4	22.2
Article portrays leader as a political insider	6	33.3
Article portrays leader as a novelty	5	27.8
Article comments on quality of the leader (either positive or negative)	6	33.3
Article mentions a political or election-related poll or survey in the headline, sub-headline, or first three paragraphs	3	16.7
Article mentions a political or election-related poll or survey in the rest of the story	6	33.3
Article uses a game frame in the headline, sub-headline, or first three paragraphs	6	33.3
Article uses a game frame in the rest of the story	8	44.4
Article connects the leader to a policy issue	11	61.1
Article connects the leader to a crime/justice issue	2	11.1
Article connects the leader to a social welfare issue	2	11.1
Article connects the leader to an immigration or multiculturalism issue	1	5.5
Article connects the leader to some other policy issue (see Appendix A)	11	61.1
Article mentions the leader's family	1	5.5
Article mentions the leader's personal life	0	0

Article mentions the leader's appearance	0	0
Article mentions the leader's wardrobe	0	0
Article includes a direct quotation from the leader	8	44.4
Article includes a quotation about the leader	8	44.4
Article includes a paraphrase of something the leader has said	11	61.1
Article uses negative/aggressive speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (see Appendix A)	7	38.9
Article uses neutral speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (See Appendix A)	9	50.0
Article uses positive speech verbs to describe what the leader has said (See Appendix A)	1	5.5
Total n = 18		

Discussion

Mentions of Race, Gender, and Minority/Majority Status

Mentions of race, gender, and minority status were completely absent from this sample, representing a diversion from the previous three sets of data, particularly that covering the leaders' debate. While election night coverage did present a main theme of reviewing the leadership and performance of the candidates throughout the campaign, most of the coverage focused on the horse-race between the candidates, especially in articles published as votes were actively being counted. This is likely the reason why race, gender, and minority status did not feature heavily. Much like the sample covering the writ issue, the media's focus was turned more so towards the horse-race between Trudeau and O'Toole than it was to the personal characteristics of the candidates. At the end of the campaign, it makes little sense for the media to focus heavily on the characteristics of the leaders after Canadians have already made their decisions at the ballot. It is certainly more relevant to focus on which candidate is likely to form government at that time, meaning personal characteristics fade into the background.

Support from minority communities was mentioned on one occasion, this was directed towards O'Toole in relation to his advocacy for 2SLGBTQ+ rights and women's reproductive rights. This

contradicts existing literature on the increased likelihood of racialized candidates to be associated with 'minority issues,' although this linkage was not made frequently enough in this sample to draw any substantive conclusions. Support from mainstream communities occurred on four occasions, two in relation to Singh and two in relation to O'Toole. While it is consistent with existing literature that O'Toole was presented as more 'marketable' to mainstream communities, this changes when contrasted with the equal number of times Singh was presented as marketable to the mainstream. Clearly, as has also been demonstrated in the previous samples, appeal to mainstream Canada has increasingly become divorced from gendered and racialized dynamics. This is certainly a positive development, particularly as it reduces the divide between political 'insiders' and 'outsiders' that is often reinforced between racialized and white candidates. Even in their critique of Singh, the media emphasised that he was genuinely popular among a broad coalition of Canadians (Anglin 2021), representing a move away from the binary insider-outsider dichotomy that so often appears on racialized lines.

Portrayals of Political Leadership: Novelty, Quality, Framing

Portrayals of the leaders as novelties occurred on five occasions, all in reference to O'Toole. While this is somewhat consistent with previous samples, notably missing is Paul, who typically accompanies O'Toole in being portrayed as a novelty. While O'Toole's portrayal as a novelty is reflective of reality, as I have reiterated in previous sections, Paul's absence reflects (again) a broader trend within this sample of an exclusive focus on the three male leaders. While Paul was unlikely to form a government and thus less relevant to this sample than she may have been for the other sets of data, the fact that she was essentially erased altogether is concerning.

Portrayals of leaders as political insiders occurred on six occasions. Four of these were in relation to Trudeau and two of these were in relation to Singh. Keeping with previous samples, coverage of Trudeau and Singh as political insiders is merely reflective of reality, given that they were both incumbent leaders and had each faced at least one election prior to 2021. Additionally, the insider-novelty dynamic clearly does not appear along racial lines, given that Singh has often been portrayed as a political

insider with significant knowledge and experience in the Canadian political sphere. Thus, it is unlikely that any conclusions regarding racialized or gendered mediation can be drawn here.

In this sample, a relatively underwhelming portion of articles employed a game frame or used polling to reinforce the use of a game frame - less than half. While this sample did not feature the lowest amount of game frame use, I expected it would be used more frequently, given the horse-race nature of election night. I suspect that the game frame was used infrequently because while O'Toole and Trudeau were neck-in-neck in the latter third of the campaign, by the time the election reached its later days, a Trudeau minority government was essentially solidified (Leger 2021). Thus, it may have been redundant for the media to attempt to pit Trudeau and O'Toole against each other in a horse-race, particularly if polling was demonstrating a clear tendency towards a favourable Trudeau outcome.

While in previous samples, the game frame was used to construct a gendered and racialized understanding of the horse-race via sports and warfare metaphors, these were also notably absent from this sample, save for two instances. When the game frame *was* employed, it was mainly to focus on which parties would be picking up or losing which seats, and how the Liberals, Conservatives, and NDP would be faring compared to the previous election. However, Paul was erased from these comparisons altogether, reifying the idea of the political sphere as a solely masculine space. The use of the game frame to position the three male candidates against each other in the 'horse race' - to the exclusion of the woman candidate - represents a continuation of gendered political dynamics.

Policy Associations

The following table outlines the leader-to-policy associations found in this sample:

Table 7: Leader-to-policy associations for election night.

Policy	Justin Trudeau	Erin O'Toole	Jagmeet Singh	Annamie Paul
Economy	1	0	0	0
Energy	0	0	0	0
2SLGBTQ+	0	3	0	0

rights/issues				
Healthcare (incl. Dental & pharmaceutical services)	0	1	4	0
Environment/climate change	1	3	0	0
Government	0	0	0	0
Health (COVID-19, vaccines)	2	0	0	0
Telecommunications	0	0	0	0
Jobs & Industry	0	0	0	0
Tax policy	0	0	3	0
Foreign affairs	1	0	0	0
Childcare	1	0	1	0
Crime/justice	0	2	0	0
Housing	0	0	0	0
Welfare	0	0	1	0
Indigenous rights/issues	1	0	0	0
Inequality	0	3	0	0
National defence	0	0	0	0
Immigration	0	0	0	0
Labour	0	1	0	0

Two notable trends appear from the leader-to-policy associations in this sample: O'Toole's disproportionate association with minority rights issues and Paul's complete erasure. I will discuss them as follows.

As demonstrated in Table 7, O'Toole was associated with 2SLGBTQ+ rights three times and inequality issues three times. None of the other candidates were associated at all with either of these

issues. This is perplexing because out of all the candidates, O'Toole is the most emblematic of hegemonic white masculinity, and leads the party that has traditionally been the least hospitable to minority rights issues. O'Toole's disproportionate association with minority rights issues directly contradicts existing literature, and while an explanation may not be evident, this dynamic reveals that 'minority issues' are becoming increasingly divorced from 'minority candidates.' This has been demonstrated in the previous samples, and perhaps represents a positive development in terms of which issues are deemed important or relevant enough to be dealt with by *all* candidates, not just those who might be directly affected by these issues.

The most glaring conclusion drawn from Table 7 is the complete absence of any leader-to-policy associations for Annamie Paul. It has been well-established that Paul was erased from this sample altogether as none of the articles made any reference to her, even in passing. What to make of this with regards to leader-to-policy associations is less clear. However, the erasure of Paul from this sample clearly speaks to who the news media deems important enough to include in the final electoral horse-race. The three male leaders received roughly proportional leader-to-policy associations, with O'Toole receiving the most, then Singh, and Trudeau receiving the least. Even though Singh was unlikely to form government nor official opposition, he was clearly deemed important enough to be linked to several policy issues, including big-ticket issues like health care and climate change. Thus, while Paul's erasure from the sample leaves several questions unanswered, including the question of whether Paul's erasure was due to gendered or racialized factors, *who* the news media *did* choose to highlight with regards to discussions on policy provides a clearer insight into the dynamics at play.

Family, Appearance, Personal Life

The families, appearances, and personal lives of the leaders were virtually absent from this sample, save one instance where Trudeau and O'Toole were mentioned to have gone to vote on election day with their spouses. While this alone is a step in the right direction, in that families are becoming increasingly absent from commentary on political leadership, particularly as the news media paid close

attention to leadership throughout the campaign in this sample, conclusions from the previous three samples prove that personalization in this matter has certainly not left political media altogether. Thus, while personalization is clearly on a downwards trend for both male and female candidates, it is essential to be wary of when it *does* occur. As the previous samples have demonstrated, the remnants of personalization in Canadian political media overwhelmingly favour hegemonic representations of masculinity, and often paint gendered and racialized pictures of political leadership.

Reported Speech

A surprisingly low proportion of the articles in this sample used direct quotes from any of the leaders. Among those that did, three were from O'Toole, two were from Singh, and three were from Trudeau. Paraphrasing featured much more prominently than direct quoting, occurring in 61.1% of articles sampled. These occurrences were distributed in nearly equal proportions to direct quoting, with O'Toole and Trudeau each being paraphrased four times, and Singh being paraphrased three. Paul was not paraphrased at all. The relatively equitable distribution of direct quoting and paraphrasing is positive, although the lack of any quoting or paraphrasing whatsoever from Paul is somewhat concerning. This may be attributable to the fact that Paul was unlikely to make any considerable gains at the conclusion of the campaign, let alone form government. That said, Singh was also unlikely to form government, yet he was quoted and paraphrased in roughly equal proportions to Trudeau and O'Toole. While I am hesitant to explicitly label this an instance of gendered mediation, it is certainly something that is to be noted given that it fits into the broader theme of Paul's absence in much of the news coverage.

In terms of quotations about each of the leaders, quotes about Trudeau featured four times, quotes about O'Toole featured three times, and quotes about Singh featured once. No articles featured a quote about Paul. Concerns about Paul's erasure aside, it is important to examine the discrepancies between quotations about O'Toole and Trudeau, and quotations about Singh. While I initially hypothesised that Singh and Paul would appear more often as the object of reported speech rather than the subject, this disproves this dynamic (as was also true in my sample on major campaign announcements). This is likely

the case because of the news media's focus on who would form government at the conclusion of the election, which was largely between O'Toole and Trudeau. Thus, it is understandable that O'Toole and Trudeau had quotations about them featured more often, whether they be from political commentators, their fellow leaders, or each other.

Lastly, the use of negative speech verbs and neutral speech verbs were roughly on par with each other in this sample. Positive speech verbs only featured on one occasion. All instances of negative speech verbs were attributed to Trudeau, whereas neutral speech verbs were distributed relatively evenly across the three male leaders. Limited conclusions can be drawn from this observation, other than acknowledging that Trudeau likely had more negative speech verbs attributed to him due to his position of having to 'defend' his leadership as Prime Minister. Ultimately, the use of negative and neutral speech verbs did not serve to perpetuate any narrative.

Conclusion

In my final section on quantitative data, I received the data collected from my sample of articles covering election night on September 20, 2021. As has been done for previous samples, I connected the data to existing literature and common manifestations of gendered and racialized mediation. From this process, I have derived the following conclusions:

1. Annamie Paul was completely absent from this sample. This provides insight into who the media deems worthy of inclusion in the final electoral horse-race, as well as in their post-mortem reviews of the candidates' leadership.

2. Mentions of race, gender, and minority status were completely absent. This diverged from the previous three samples, and thus, while appearing to be a positive development on the surface, does not indicate a lack of gendered and racialized mediation altogether. Support from minority communities featured one time, in relation to O'Toole, which contradicts existing literature. Singh and O'Toole were presented as appealing to the mainstream, also contradicting existing

scholarship. This may represent a more positive trend, and a reduction of the insider-outsider dichotomy.

3. O'Toole was portrayed as a novelty, and Singh and Trudeau were portrayed as insiders, although these are both reflective of reality. However, the insider-novelty dichotomy again appears to transcend racial boundaries. The game frame also did not feature heavily, although when it did, it reinforced the horse-race between the three male candidates alone.

4. O'Toole was disproportionately associated with minority rights issues compared to the other candidates, demonstrating a positive development in terms of which issues are deemed important or relevant enough to be dealt with by *all* candidates, not just those who might be directly affected by these issues.

5. Mentions of the families, appearances, and personal lives were also virtually absent from this sample, and while this may also appear positive on the surface, conclusions from the previous three samples prove that personalization in this matter has certainly not left political media altogether. However, this sample and previous samples clearly demonstrate a downwards trend in personalization for both male and female candidates.

6. A low proportion of articles in this sample used direct quotes, whereas paraphrasing was much more prominent. The three male leaders were paraphrased equally, again raising concerns about Paul's erasure, but ruling out questions about racialized mediation with regards to Singh. Singh also received disproportionately fewer quotations about him, contradicting existing literature. Neutral and negative speech verbs appeared in roughly equal proportions, although the neutral verbs were distributed evenly, whereas negative verbs were only used to describe the speech of Trudeau.

Conclusion

This chapter reviewed the quantitative data I collected during my coding process for each of the four chosen electoral milestones: the writ issue, major campaign announcements for each of the leaders,

the English language leaders' debate, and election night. In Chapter Three, I will discuss the main themes that emerged from my qualitative coding process. I will then combine the insights gained from my quantitative and qualitative data to produce several main conclusions on the state of race, gender, and leadership in Canadian political media.

CHAPTER THREE

Qualitative Insights & Overarching Narratives

Introduction

To conduct my critical discourse analysis, I took detailed notes based on the answers to my guiding questions (see: methodology). I investigated the ways in which the media texts diverted from a neutral retelling of the various milestones in the elections, how the texts generalised beyond what was apparent, and how the racialized and woman candidates were positioned relative to the white and male candidates. Based on these results, I derived three main themes that emerged throughout all four samples of articles. First, Annamie Paul received 'lose-lose' representation, in that she was either erased from coverage altogether, or covered in line with gendered and racialized tropes. Second, the media established a hegemonically masculine standard for political leadership. Third, there was a persistent tension between 'horse-race' coverage of the leaders and more personal accounts of their leadership throughout the campaign.

Overarching Themes

Annamie Paul's Lose-Lose Representation & Symbolic Annihilation

One of the most prominent narratives that emerged across all four of my samples was Annamie Paul's persistent 'lose-lose' coverage. Paul was often erased from news coverage altogether, but when she did appear, her coverage overwhelmingly contained gendered and racialized tropes to the exclusion of any positive coverage of her character or policy. In the samples on the writ issue and campaign announcements, Paul was largely absent from most of the news coverage. However, when she did appear, the media texts emphasised her status as a racialized woman and her party's infighting to the detriment of more relevant considerations such as her policy or platform. In the sample on the leaders' debate, Paul featured much more frequently, although her coverage relied heavily on gendered and racialized tropes. Paul was framed as the 'outsider' to the other leaders, was tasked with bringing a new brand of politics to

the stage (which was linked explicitly to her status as a racialized woman) and became the spokesperson for any gender or race issues, even though they were discussed by all candidates during the debate. Even articles that attempted to frame Paul in a positive light used her status as a racialized woman to contrast her with the three male leaders and construct her as an outsider to the group of leaders and to politics. This was explicitly different from coverage of Paul as a *newcomer* to politics - while this was reflective of reality, and much coverage focused on the fact that this was her first general election - the coverage Paul received in the leaders' debate framed her as a clear outsider and served to pit her against the other three candidates based on her race and gender. Lastly, in the sample covering election night, Paul was erased altogether, reflecting who the media deems worthy of inclusion in the final electoral horse-race, as well as in their post-mortem reviews of the candidates' leadership.

On all fronts, Annamie Paul's representation in coverage of this election was to her detriment. She was either erased from coverage and visibility altogether, or 'othered' based on her gender and race. This lose-lose dynamic reflects two important concepts: symbolic annihilation and the intersection of gendered and racialized mediation.

On a broader level, symbolic annihilation can be defined as the absence, condemnation, or trivialization of a particular group in the media (cited in Tuchman 2000, 154). Given that media is a site where dominant cultural attitudes are reproduced and affirmed, the symbolic annihilation of a particular group in the media can contribute directly to their social disempowerment or overall reduced societal status (Coleman & Yochim 2008, 2-7). Symbolic annihilation has both a gendered and racialized dimension, both of which are important here, and arguably intersect in the case of Annamie Paul. Women are symbolically annihilated in the mass media. They are either underrepresented or not represented at all in the mass media compared to their share of the global population, and when they are represented, they are either condemned or minimised with regards to their social status (Tuchman 2000, 154). Similar patterns exist for racialized people in that they are generally underrepresented and receive negative representation when they *are* portrayed in the media (Coleman & Yochim 2008). Annamie Paul was

certainly symbolically annihilated in coverage of this election, given that she was poorly represented overall, and the representations of her that did exist were both stereotypical and generally negative.

I have discussed at length the intersection of gendered and racialized mediation as it relates to Annamie Paul, and this dynamic was present in both the coverage of the leaders' debate (where it emerged most prominently) and as a broader theme across all four samples. When Paul was framed as an 'outsider' to politics or within the group of leaders, it was almost always based on her status as a *Black woman,* not due to her status as a woman or a Black person alone. This falls in line with Crenshaw's theory of intersectionality (Crenshaw 1989) and demonstrates that Paul's symbolic annihilation (as it relates to her trivialization) is at least in some way connected to her status as both a woman and a racialized person. Jagmeet Singh, who is also racialized, received little to no race-based coverage, and received relatively consistent positive representation across all four samples (noting, however, that his party had a much higher profile than that of Paul). This demonstrates the unique link between gender and race in the symbolic annihilation and overall negative representation of Paul.

Ultimately, Paul's representation in the media throughout the election was a 'lose-lose' scenario. She experienced significant symbolic annihilation and received generally limited positive or even neutral coverage of both her policy and her character as a leader. This remained a consistent theme across all four samples and provides evidence that gendered and racialized mediation remain prominent in Canadian political media, particularly for racialized women.

Masculinity as Political Leadership Ideal

A second theme that emerged in both my content and discourse analysis was the idea of masculinity as the ideal standard for political leadership. This was indicated mainly through the ways in which the media commented both positively and negatively on the candidates' viability for leadership. Erin O'Toole received by far the most positive comments on his leadership viability. Some of these comments were explicitly related to manifestations of O'Toole's masculinity, such as referring to him as a tough-looking leader and referencing his physical fitness (Ibbitson 2021) or using his role as a father

figure and time serving in the Canadian Armed Forces to humanise him and advocate for his leadership viability (Maloney 2021). Others were less explicit but sought to uplift O'Toole's profile and viability for leadership by highlighting his poised, calm, and headstrong style of leadership.

O'Toole also received his fair share of negative comments on his leadership viability, but these were distributed more evenly between O'Toole and Trudeau (whereas Trudeau received few positive comments on his viability for leadership). For both leaders, their supposed lack of viability for political leadership was attributed to weakness or limited focus on 'the right' issues (i.e., focusing on soft policy issues as opposed to hard policy issues). While these alone provide little insight into what the media considers to be ideal qualities for political leadership, particularly as lack of command may be genuine grounds for a critique of either Trudeau or O'Toole, a contrast of these narratives with the narratives attributed to viability for political leadership provides greater context. The media's valorisation of O'Toole's masculinity and linkage of these qualities with viability for political leadership in combination with the narrative of 'weakness' as dominating negative leadership coverage (as opposed to genuine critiques of policy) demonstrates the tendency to idealise hegemonic masculinity as the standard for leadership.

It is also notable that most positive comments on leadership viability were directed towards O'Toole, who is the most proximal to white hegemonic standards of masculinity. Smith argues that a male candidates' reliability and viability for leadership is most often grounded in representations of their gender (Smith 2021, 16). This is confirmed by Trimble et al., who find that male candidates' "corporeal performance of masculinity" serves to reinforce and legitimise their viability for political leadership, although this is mainly to the benefit of those who conform to conventional standards of masculinity (Trimble et al. 2015, 320). The media's overtly positive focus on O'Toole's leadership and lack of positive attention paid to the leadership of Trudeau and Singh - the lack of attention paid to Paul aside - clearly demonstrates a continuation of this dynamic. Overall, the articles in this sample reaffirmed the linkage between hegemonic masculinity and viability for political leadership, not only through valorising the hegemonically masculine qualities of O'Toole and drawing connections between such qualities and

their leadership, but also by citing arguably 'un-masculine' qualities in diminishing the leadership

viabilities of all three male candidates.

Horse-Race vs. Personalization

The third major theme that persisted across all samples, except for the articles covering major

campaign announcements, was a tension between horse-race coverage of the leaders and more

personalised coverage or coverage of policy. The two narratives never existed simultaneously, and few

other narratives existed beyond the two. The media alternated between both narratives, with the horse-

race narrative appearing much more frequently. However, regardless of which narrative was used, the

frames of the media texts supported a gendered and racialized understanding of Canadian politics. When

the media texts *did* turn towards personalization and covered the leaders' individual characters, it resorted

to focusing on the leaders' gender and race to the exclusion of other factors, particularly for Paul and

O'Toole. And when news writers employed a horse-race narrative, it was typically to pit the three male

leaders against each other while excluding or erasing Annamie Paul.

As was demonstrated in the previous chapter, personalised coverage of the leaders was a

relatively infrequent occurrence. By and large, the horse-race narrative dominated coverage of the

campaign, and the media placed disproportionate focus on which of the candidates was ahead in the polls,

who was likely to gain or the most seats, any events that may have damaged or increased the fortunes of

the leaders, or attacks the leaders made against each other throughout the campaign. This aided in

constructing a gendered and racialized understanding of Canadian politics in two main ways: firstly, the

horse-race narrative served mainly to pit the three male leaders (Singh, O'Toole, and Trudeau) against

each other, and often only O'Toole and Trudeau were seen as competitors in the horse-race. While the

fact that the male leaders were leading the three largest parties certainly played a role in this dynamic,

Paul was still leading a well-established and well-known national party yet received almost no coverage

in terms of her role in the electoral landscape. Secondly, the language employed in coverage of the horse-

race was overwhelmingly gendered, as the media relied heavily on sports and warfare metaphors as well

as negative speech verbs to construct the horse-race narrative. As discussed in the previous chapter, these lexical choices serve to exclude women from the broader political narrative, and construct politics as a domain exclusively for men. Ultimately, while it is difficult to parse out which of these two elements are directly related to race and gender, the exclusion of Paul (who is a racialized woman) through both narrative and lexical choices serves to construct Canadian politics as a majority white, male-dominated sphere.

In the few instances in which personalisation did appear in the samples, they were almost exclusively directed towards one of two things: Annamie Paul's outsider status as a Black woman, or Erin O'Toole's proximity to standards of white hegemonic masculinity. By isolating Paul's race and gender in coverage of her leadership, the news media was effective at framing her as an outsider to politics and positioning her in opposition to the other candidates. Similarly, by highlighting O'Toole's proximity to hegemonic masculinity by forefronting his previous occupations, physical appearance, and headstrong leadership style, the news media used personalised coverage to implicitly create a particular standard for leadership. This serves to frame anyone who does not meet the implied standard as less viable for political leadership and generally unwelcome in the field of politics.

Ultimately, while the horse-race narrative dominated coverage of the election, there was a persistent tension between that narrative and personalised coverage of the leaders. The media alternated between these two frames in covering the election; when one was not used, the media employed the other. Both frames ultimately served to reify a gendered and racialized understanding of Canadian politics, albeit in different ways, and the use of the frames provides insight into how distinct media tactics can ultimately provide different means to the same end - constructing Canadian politics as a gendered and racialized realm.

Conclusion

This chapter reviewed three main themes I gathered from my qualitative coding process. These themes persisted across coverage of the whole election and were not particular to any one sample. They

represented broader trends in terms of how the media constructs a gendered and racialized understanding of Canadian politics. The first theme I discussed was Annamie Paul's 'lose-lose' coverage - in that she was either covered negatively or in line with gendered or racialized stereotypes, or not covered at all. I discussed this phenomenon in relation to the concept of symbolic annihilation and the intersection of gendered and racialized mediation. The second theme I discussed was the media's construction of hegemonic masculinity as the ideal standard for leadership. I reviewed how the media valorised Erin O'Toole's proximity to white hegemonic masculinity and condemned candidates that failed to meet the hyper-masculine political leadership standard, and how this relates to who the media considers viable for political leadership. Lastly, I discussed a persistent tension between the game frame or horse-race coverage of the election and personalised coverage of the leaders. I argued that both narratives, while used in differing proportions, served to construct Annamie Paul as an outsider and isolate her based on her race and gender. Ultimately, both narratives were successful in constructing a gendered and racialized understanding of Canadian politics.

In my final chapter, I will return to my research question and hypotheses to discuss the extent to which they were challenged or supported by my quantitative and qualitative data. I will then pursue a broader discussion about what the results of my study mean for the state of Canadian politics and political media and draw a final conclusion on gendered and racialized mediation in the 2021 Canadian federal election.

CHAPTER FOUR

What Does this all Mean? Discussion and Review

This chapter seeks to tie my quantitative and qualitative data with my research question and four hypotheses. I will discuss the extent to which they were supported or challenged by my data and undertake a high-level discussion on what the results of my study mean for the state of Canadian politics and political media. Lastly, I will draw a final conclusion on the presence of gendered and racialized mediation in news coverage of the 2021 Canadian federal election.

Hypotheses

Prior to executing my data collection process, I devised four hypotheses based on existing gendered and racialized mediation literature. They are as follows:

H1: Annamie Paul will be covered differentially in comparison to Trudeau, O'Toole, and Singh. She will experience increased personalization, disproportionate association with 'soft' policy issues, and her gender will consistently appear as a salient feature in her coverage. This will function to frame her as novel and diminish her perceived leadership viability.

H2: Jagmeet Singh and Annamie Paul will be covered differentially in comparison to Trudeau and O'Toole. Their racialized status will appear as a salient feature in their coverage, they will be disproportionately associated with 'minority' policy issues, and they will be framed as novelties compared to the other candidates.

H3: Jagmeet Singh will be covered differentially in comparison to Trudeau and O'Toole. He will be both racialized and gendered, although differently from Paul. Trudeau and O'Toole's proximity to white hegemonic masculinity will be forefronted to decrease perceptions of Singh's leadership viability. This will manifest itself through tactics such as the family strategy, adoption of the 'decent man' persona, or relation of Trudeau and O'Toole's bodies to ideals of political leadership.

H4: In reporting speech, the news media will disproportionately assign negative speech verbs to Annamie Paul only. Both Paul and Jagmeet Singh will be quoted less, and they will less often be the speaker or subject (but rather object) in coverage of reported speech. O'Toole and Trudeau will benefit most from coverage of reported speech.

Hypothesis 1

Hypothesis 1 (H1) was largely supported. While Annamie Paul was not disproportionately associated with 'soft' policy issues - in fact, the men were more frequently associated with 'soft' policy issues - she was more frequently associated with issues pertaining to racial and gender inequality, particularly during the leaders' debate. While Paul was significantly less present in the articles compared to the male leaders, when she was covered, her status as a woman did appear as a significant feature of her coverage and was often used to distinguish her from the other leaders.

Hypothesis 2

Hypothesis 2 (H2) was supported for Paul but not for Singh. Jagmeet Singh did not experience racialized mediation. While the principles of H2 were evident for Paul - her race appeared as a salient feature in her coverage, she was disproportionately associated with 'minority' policy issues, and the media used her race to frame her as a political novelty - Singh was covered in the same fashion as the two white leaders. His race or visible minority status was not mentioned at all. As I have discussed in previous sections, this indicates an intersecting effect between gendered and racialized mediation for Annamie Paul.

Hypothesis 3

Hypothesis 3 (H3) was not supported. Singh's racialized status was not forefronted in his coverage, and his race was not used to differentiate him from Trudeau and O'Toole. Comments on his leadership viability were overwhelmingly positive, and he was never framed in opposition to the other candidates. Instead, it was Paul who was consistently framed as an outsider among the four leaders. While O'Toole's proximity to white hegemonic masculinity was forefronted using the 'decent man' persona, this did not work to distinguish him from Singh, as illustrated by the lack of comments attributed to Singh's race or visible minority status. Additionally, Trudeau's proximity to white hegemonic masculinity was not used to promote his viability for political leadership.

Hypothesis 4

Hypothesis 4 (H4) was partially supported. Negative speech verbs were assigned almost exclusively to Trudeau and O'Toole, apart from the leaders' debate, where they were applied to all leaders equally. Paul and Singh were also quoted in proportion to their appearances in each of the samples and were not more often the object than subject or speaker in reported speech. O'Toole and Trudeau did not benefit the most from reported speech. Positive speech verbs about them rarely featured at all in any of the samples, and they also received the most negative speech verbs assigned to them. On the whole, reported speech was not a vehicle through which gendered or racialized mediation was perpetuated across any of the samples.

Research Question & Discussion

The research question I posed was: How was gender and race constructed in news media coverage of the four major party leaders in the 2021 Canadian federal election, and what does this reveal about broader social discourses surrounding suitability for political leadership?

I will address my research question in two parts. Firstly, I will answer the question of how gender and race was constructed in news media coverage of the 2021 Canadian federal election. Ultimately, my data has shown that gender and race was constructed or utilised in two main ways. Firstly, it was used as a marker of novelty for Annamie Paul and served to frame her as an outsider in comparison with the other candidates. The highlighting of her gender and race as a salient feature of her coverage was used to situate her as an anomaly in comparison to the other leaders, and to distinguish her to the exclusion of her policy and campaign commitments. When she was not covered in this manner, she was erased from coverage entirely. This confirms the findings of Cameron and Shaw, who find that the media pays disproportionate attention to male party leaders, in turn constructing women leaders as novel and newsworthy (Cameron & Shaw 2020, 151). This may lead to increased coverage, but when it does, it highlights gender as a salient characteristic, contrasting women leaders' views with those of "the men." (151)

Secondly, gender and race were used to uphold a particular standard for political leadership based on proximity to white hegemonic masculinity. This was accomplished through emphasising and valorising Erin O'Toole's traditionally masculine characteristics, including his physique, his leadership style, and his familial roles. To a lesser extent, this was also achieved by denigrating Trudeau's supposed lack of masculinity as a means of critiquing his viability for political leadership. By upholding and valorising a certain standard of masculinity as the ideal for political leadership while demonising those who did not adhere to that standard, the media effectively used gender (and arguably race) to construct an 'ideal' political leader.

I have already discussed the implications of my second question - what these constructions reveal about broader social discourses surrounding suitability for political leadership - at length, and I will reiterate my findings as follows. Ultimately, the media upheld a discourse surrounding political leadership that was largely related to white hegemonic masculinity. It valorized adherence to standards of white hegemonic masculinity, and directly linked these standards to leadership capability and viability, particularly for Erin O'Toole. This confirms the findings of both Smith and Trimble et al.: Smith finds that the male political advantage is reserved for the most masculine candidate (Smith 2021, 3), and that assessments of reliability and leadership style by the media are typically grounded in representations of hegemonic masculinity (16). Trimble et al. reassert this finding, arguing that coverage of male candidate's bodies served to authenticate and legitimate their political leadership through repeated references to the physical size and physique of leadership candidates (Trimble et al. 2015, 320). Through the use of Erin O'Toole's physique and proximity to hegemonic masculinity, the news media effectively upheld a standard for leadership that relegated non-adherent leaders to political outsider status - particularly Annamie Paul. In terms of what these findings reveal about dominant discourses surrounding suitability for political leadership, the typical leadership standard (white, male, and traditionally masculine) remains in place and was reaffirmed by the news media in the course of this election.

Discussion

In drawing a conclusion on the state of gendered and racialized mediation in the 2021 Canadian federal election I argue the following: Gendered and racialized mediation were present in news coverage of this election, albeit less explicitly than has been documented in previous elections. In fact, the most prominent form of gendered and racialized mediation was the symbolic annihilation of Annamie Paul, or the fact that she was erased entirely from most of the news coverage. The leaders' debate was the forum through which most outward instances of gendered and racialized mediation were perpetuated, as the media tended to resort to tropes such as aggressively masculine language and metaphors, negative speech verbs, and framing Annamie Paul as a 'spokesperson' for racialized and gendered issues. These tropes have become less commonplace over time in Canadian political news coverage. However, across the other three samples, instances of explicit gendered and racialized mediation remained scant. When they did occur, they served to paint Annamie Paul as an outsider and valorize Erin O'Toole's proximity to hegemonic masculinity, in turn creating an ideal standard for political leadership that revolves around traditionally masculine characteristics. Overall, the most prominent form of gendered and racialized mediation was an intersection between the two for Annamie Paul, as Jagmeet Singh experienced almost no racialized coverage whatsoever.

What do these conclusions mean for the state of Canadian political media, and Canadian politics overall? Ultimately, the general lack of explicit instances of gendered and racialized mediation (save for the leaders' debate) represents a positive step towards more equitable news coverage of candidates, particularly as Canada's slate of political party leaders becomes increasingly diverse. While the symbolic annihilation of Annamie Paul is concerning, the absence of common tropes that serve to exclude and demonise women and racialized leaders, such as increased personalization, focus on appearance, and exclusive linkage with 'women's' or 'ethnic' policy issues is a positive sign that Canadian political media is beginning a move away from long-standing harmful journalistic practices.

Despite this, two concerns remain. Firstly, the leaders' debate was an outlier in the general trend of limited instances of explicit gendered and racialized mediation. In coverage of the leaders' debate, the news media essentially regressed into a style of coverage of the leaders that was characteristic of debates

from decades ago, such as those documented by Gidengil and Everitt in the late 1990s and early 2000s (Gidengil and Everitt 2003a). While the debate itself assumes an adversarial format, the leaders' debate is among the most recognizable and widely observed features of each electoral campaign. It is more likely that the voting public is paying attention to media coverage of the English-language leaders debate than, say, to an individual campaign announcement. It is therefore incumbent upon journalists to maintain equitable reporting of leaders while covering the debate despite its adversarial character, given that the news media is instrumental in conveying impressions about both the leaders and who 'belongs' in Canadian politics (Sreberny-Mohammadi & Ross 2000, 93; McCombs & Shaw 1972). In this sense, the news media fell short in its coverage of the 2021 campaign, and coverage of the leaders' debate will likely remain a concern in future elections until these regressive practices are remedied (as the media has clearly done for coverage of other events).

Secondly, barriers in equitable coverage clearly remain for racialized women. Jagmeet Singh received virtually no coverage related to his race or visible minority status, but the coverage that did exist of Annamie Paul quite frequently focused on her status as a Black woman. While the lack of attention to Singh's racialized status is indeed a positive step, this demonstrates that racialized women are still viewed as outsiders to Canadian politics, a view which the news media was complicit in reinforcing during this election. I predicted, based on my literature review and particularly Crenshaw's theory of intersectionality, that Annamie Paul would receive a unique form of news coverage that resulted from the intersection between her status as a Black person and as a woman. I was correct in this assumption, and news coverage in this election reveals the continued social marginalisation faced by racialized women that Crenshaw outlined in her theory of intersectionality (Crenshaw 1989, 149). Ultimately, progress remains for racialized women to be seen as equal participants in the Canadian political sphere. While the solution to this issue does not lie solely in the hands of the news media, by reducing focus on Annamie Paul's race and gender beyond circumstances where they might be relevant and ceasing to frame racialized women as outsiders to non-racialized or male candidates, the media can greatly improve public perception of who is considered to 'belong' in Canadian politics.

Conclusion

This chapter returned to my original hypotheses and research question and discussed the extent to which they were supported or challenged by my quantitative or qualitative data. I then drew a final conclusion on gendered and racialized mediation in coverage of the 2021 election, wherein I argued that gendered and racialized mediation was present in coverage of this election, albeit to a less explicit extent. I discussed how gendered and racialized mediation was achieved through symbolic annihilation, use of race and gender as ostracising factors, and construction of a hegemonically masculine standard for political leadership. I also undertook a discussion of what these findings mean for the state of Canadian political media, concluding that while the lack of explicit instances of gendered and racialized mediation were a positive step in moving towards more equitable coverage, concerns remain in terms of the media's coverage of the leaders' debate and barriers to political equality for racialized women.

CONCLUSION

Despite the evolving nature of news consumption in Canada and abroad, Canadian political news remains an important venue through which voters engage with the democratic process during election time. Beyond just communicating the goings-on of federal and provincial elections, the news media conveys to the public what is important, reflects the places of various groups in society, and reifies shared meanings and discourses. As Canadian politics becomes more diverse, Canadian political media must reflect this changing landscape in its messaging to voters: a critical task given the great effect of the media on broader social discourses. With these factors in mind, this thesis has asked the question of how gender and race was in news media coverage of the four major party leaders in the 2021 Canadian federal election, and what this reveals about broader social discourses surrounding suitability for political leadership. The 2021 Canadian federal election was the first time two racialized party leaders, one of whom was a woman, contested the Prime Ministerial role. This thesis has explored how the news media wrestled with this new landscape, the effects of its coverage on standards for political leadership, and its impact on barriers to political inclusion for minority party leaders. In my research, I undertook a quantitative content analysis and a critical discourse analysis of print and digital news articles covering key points in the 2021 Canadian federal election to extract key themes and observations regarding gendered and racialized mediation.

In Chapter One, I outlined and operationalized key terms in my thesis, surveying key literature on gendered and racialized mediation. I explored gendered and racialized mediation both on a broader, more conceptual level, and in terms of their application to specific electoral contexts in various Canadian elections. In this chapter, I also outlined my methodology and justified my chosen case study. In Chapter Two, I reviewed the results of my quantitative content analysis process and drew key conclusions on gendered and racialized mediation within each sample of articles. Here, I surveyed news articles covering the writ issue, major campaign announcements for each leader, the English-language leaders' debate, and election night. I used the data collected for each of these samples and the distribution of codes among the

leaders to draw conclusions about the extent and nature of gendered and racialized mediation across coverage of this election. In Chapter Three, I reviewed the results of my critical discourse analysis and explored three key themes that emerged across all my samples: Annamie Paul's simultaneous symbolic annihilation and intersecting gendered and racialized mediation, Erin O'Toole's masculinity as the ideal standard for political leadership, and the tension between 'horse-race' coverage and more personalised coverage of the leaders. In Chapter Four, I returned to my hypotheses and research question and discussed the extent to which they were supported or challenged by my quantitative and qualitative data. I then drew a final conclusion about the state of gendered and racialized mediation throughout the entire campaign, provided a conclusive answer to my research question, and discussed the significance of my findings for the state of Canadian political media more broadly.

This thesis sought to approach gendered and racialized mediation in Canadian politics through the lens of a single federal election. The potential for further research in this area is therefore quite broad. This study is easily replicated in the context of other elections, both provincial and federal (and even municipal), and the scope of this study opens the door to a comparative approach. At the time of writing, the next federal election is scheduled to take place two years from now, but as the 2021 Canadian federal election demonstrated, fixed-date election legislation is often rendered meaningless in the context of a minority Parliament. Regardless of when the next federal election takes place, potential research could compare the results of this study with the results produced from surveying news coverage of the next election, to examine progress or developments in journalistic practices and Canadian politics over time. In a similar vein, future research could undertake a retroactive comparison, setting the results of this study against existing research on previous elections. A comparative approach would provide a more cohesive picture of the changing nature of Canadian political media, and insight into potential trends or indicators of future development.

While the results of this study may appear disconcerting, it is important to note that this thesis reflects what is perhaps a glimmer of hope in an otherwise concerning context: the fact that Canadian politics is constantly changing and evolving. Twenty years ago, as scholars such as Gidengil and Everitt

and Trimble noted, women in politics experienced a barrage of comments on appearance, family, personal lives, and fashion choices from the news media, something which was virtually absent in the context of this study. As recently as 2017, the news media asked Canadians whether the nation was "ready" for a non-white federal leader (Wherry 2017), but this study found that Singh experienced almost no racialization whatsoever. While considerable progress must be made in terms of the coverage and representation of racialized women party leaders, the fact that Canadian politics and political media continues to evolve with the times provides hope that improvements may soon be made.

Canadian political media has much work to do to make our democracy and political sphere a truly equitable place for all. The media plays a key role in shaping the views and attitudes of society, and it is incumbent upon them to alter their journalistic practices to guard against ostracization, exclusion, and belittlement. It is my sincere hope that as Canada's democratic institutions become increasingly reflective of the society in which we live, the news media will reciprocate these changes, and each election cycle will serve as an improvement upon the last.

APPENDIX A

The following variables comprise my content coding framework (see Tolley 2016, 207):
- Leader's name
- Publication in which article appeared
- Date of publication
- Party of leader
- Leader is an incumbent
- Article mentions leader gender
- Article mentions leader is a visible minority
- Article mentions leader race (eg. White, South Asian, Chinese, Black, West Asian, Arab, Japanese)
- Article mentions leader is white
- Article mentions leader identifies with a minority religion (non-Christian)
- Article mentions leader speaks a minority language (language other than English or French)
- Article mentions leader speaks a majority language (English, French)
- Article mentions leader is Canadian born
- Article mentions leader's support from minority communities
- Article mentions leader's support from mainstream/majority communities
- Article portrays leader as a political insider
- Article portrays leader as a novelty
- Article comments on leader quality (either positive or negative)
- Article mentions a political or election-related poll or survey in the headline, sub-headline, or first three paragraphs
- Article mentions a political or election-related poll or survey in the rest of the story
- Article uses a game frame in the headline, sub-headline, or first three paragraphs
- Article connects the leader to a policy issue
- Article connects the leader to a crime/justice issue
- Article connects the leader to a social welfare issue (social assistance, social housing, homelessness, poverty, pensions, low incomes)
- Article connects the leader to an immigration or multiculturalism issue
- Article connects the leader to some other policy issue [identify with appropriate code]:
    - Indigenous issues
    - Agriculture, forestry, fishing, mining
    - Cities and infrastructure
    - Defence and security
    - Democratic reform
    - Economy
    - Education
    - Employment and labour
    - Energy, electricity, hydro, gas
    - Environment
    - Family, seniors, or youth
    - Foreign affairs
    - Government
    - Health
    - Intergovernmental relations
    - Trade and industry
    - Transportation
    - 2SLGBTQ+ rights
    - Other

- Article mentions the leader's family
- Article mentions the leader's personal life
- Article mentions the leader's appearance
- Article mentions the leader's wardrobe
- Article includes a direct quotation from the leader
- Article includes a quotation about the leader
- Article includes a paraphrase of something the leader has said
- Article uses negative/aggressive speech verbs to describe what the leader has said [Yes/No if one of the following codes, or a similar verb, is used]:
  - Attack
  - Blast
  - Fire at
  - Lash out
  - Jump in
  - Hammer away
  - Accuse
  - Launch an attack
  - Slam
  - Shoot back
  - Argue
  - Charge
  - Go after
  - Condemn
  - Criticise
  - Ridicule
  - Blame
  - Taunt
  - Mock
  - Denied
  - Claimed
  - Admitted
  - Insisted
  - Complained
- Article uses neutral speech verbs to describe what the leader has said [Yes/No if one of the following codes, or a similar verb, is used]:
  - Said
  - Told
  - Described
  - Asked
  - Commented
  - Talked about
- Article uses positive speech verbs to describe what the leader has said [Yes/No if one of the following codes, or a similar verb, is used]:
  - Pointed out
  - Announced
  - Explained
  - Declared
  - Indicated
  - Urged

Bibliography

Aiello, Rachel. 2021. "Trudeau calls federal election, voters go to the polls Sept. 20." *Global News,* August 15, 2021. https://www.ctvnews.ca/politics/federal-election-2021/trudeau-calls-federal-election-voters-to-go-to-the-polls-sept-20-1.5547815?cache=

Akin, David. 2021. "The fall of Green Party leader Annamie Paul: What happened behind the scenes." *Global News,* October 26, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8224694/annamie-paul-green-party-behind-scenes/

Andrew, Caroline, John Biles, Myer Siemiatycki, and Erin Tolley. 2008. *Electing a Diverse Canada: The Representation of Immigrants, Minorities, and Women.* Vancouver: UBC Press.

Auer, Meagan, Linda Trimble, Jennifer Curtin, Angelia Wagner, and V.K.G. Woodman. 2020. "Invoking the idealized family to assess political leadership and legitimacy: news coverage of Australian and Canadian premiers." *Feminist Media Studies.*

Besco, Randy, Bailey Gerrits, and J. Scott Matthews. 2016. "White Millionaires and Hockey Skates: Racialized and Gendered Mediation in News Coverage of a Canadian Mayoral Election." *International Journal of Communication* 10: 4641-4660.

Bittner, Amanda. 2010. "Personality Matters." in *Voting Behaviour in Canada,* edited by Cameron D. Anderson and Laura B. Stephenson, 183-208. Vancouver: UBC Press.

Black, Jerome, and Andrew Griffith. 2022. "Do MPs represent Canada's diversity?" *Policy Options,* January 7, 2022. https://policyoptions.irpp.org/magazines/january-2022/do-mps-represent-canadas-diversity/

Bouchard, Joanie. 2021. "'I Think Canadians Look Like All Sorts of People': Ethnicity, Political Leadership, and the Case of Jagmeet Singh." *The Journal of Race, Ethnicity, and Politics.* Cambridge University Press, 1-32.

Burke, Cindy & Sharon R. Mazzarella. 2010. "'A Slightly New Shade of Lipstick:' Gendered Mediation in Internet News Stories." *Women's Studies in Communication* 38(3): 395-418. https://doi.org/10.1080/07491409.2008.10162548

Cameron, Deborah, and Sylvia Shaw. 2020. "Constructing women's "different voice": Gendered mediation in the 2015 UK General Election." *Journal of Language and Politics* 19(1): 144-159. https://doi.org/10.1075/jlp.19086.cam

CBC News. 2021. "Canada says it knows of hundreds of citizens and permanent residents left in Afghanistan." *CBC News,* August 31, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/mendicino-garneau-afghanistan-withdraw-1.6159352

Cecco, Leyland. 2021. "Trudeau is no feminist, says Green Party leader as she battles party revolt." *The Guardian,* January 17, 2021. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/jun/17/annamie-paul-justin-trudeau-green-party-canada

Chen, Lily. 2005. "Transitivity in media texts: Negative verbal process sub-functions and narrator bias." *International Review of Applied Linguistics in Teaching* 43(1): 33-51.

Chong, Dennis, and James N. Druckman. 2007. "Framing Theory." *Annual Review of Political Science* 10: 103-126. https://www.annualreviews.org/doi/pdf/10.1146/annurev.polisci.10.072805.103054

Coleman, Robin R., and Yochim, Emily A. 2008. "The Symbolic Annihilation of Race: A Review of the "Blackness" Literature." *African American Research Perspectives* 12: 1-10.

Dekavalla, Marina. 2018. "Visualizing the game frame: constructing political competition through television images in referendum coverage." *Visual Communication* 19(4). https://doi.org/10.1177/1470357218801395

Employment and Social Development Canada. 2022. "Towards $10-a-Day: Early Learning and Child Care." Last modified December 6, 2022. https://www.canada.ca/en/employment-social-development/campaigns/child-care.html

Everbach, Tracy. 2017. "Monica Lewinsky and Shame: 1998 Newspaper Framing of 'That Woman.'" *Journal of Communication Inquiry* 41(3): 268-287. https://doi.org/10.1177/0196859917707920

Fleras, Augie. 2011. *The Media Gaze: Representations of Diversities in Canada.* Vancouver: UBC Press.

Gidengil, Elizabeth and Joanna Everitt. 2003a. "Conventional Coverage/Unconventional Politicians: Gender and Media Coverage of Canadian Leaders' Debates, 1993, 1997, 2000." *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 36(3): 559-577.

Gidengil, Elizabeth and Joanna Everitt. 2003b. "Tough Talk: How Television News Covers Male and Female Leaders of Canadian Political Parties." in *Women and Electoral Politics in Canada,* edited by Manon Tremblay & Linda Trimble, 194-210. Toronto: Oxford University Press.

Gidengil, Elizabeth, and Joanna Everitt. 2003c. "Talking Tough: Gender and reported speech in campaign news coverage." *Political Communication* 20(3): 209-232.

Goodyear-Grant, Elizabeth. 2007. "Politicians, Journalists, and their Audiences: Gendered Aspects of Televised Election News in Canada." PhD diss., McGill University. eScholarship McGill.

Ibbitson, John. 2021. "Erin O'Toole's Conservatives target suburban voters in election platform of thoughtful populism." *Globe and Mail,* August 16, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-erin-otooles-conservatives-target-suburban-voters-in-election-platform/

Interparliamentary Union. 2022. "Monthly ranking of women in national parliaments." *IPU Parline,* accessed March 2022. https://data.ipu.org/women-ranking?month=3&year=2022

Lang, Eugene. 2021. "Federal leaders' debates rarely have an impact on election outcomes, so why bother?" *The Conversation,* September 10, 2021. https://theconversation.com/federal-leaders-debates-rarely-have-an-impact-on-election-outcomes-so-why-bother-167731

Leger. 2021. "The 2021 Federal Election – September 18, 2021." Accessed March 29, 2023. https://leger360.com/surveys/the-2021-federal-election-september-18-2021/

Ljunggren, David. 2021. "Canada opposition chief, leading in election race, under fire over gun control." *Reuters,* September 4, 2021. https://www.reuters.com/world/americas/canada-opposition-chief-leading-election-race-under-fire-over-gun-control-2021-09-04/

Major, Darren. 2021. "O'Toole reverses course on guns, will maintain Liberal ban during review of classifications." *CBC News,* September 5, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/gun-control-wedge-issue-1.6165532

McAllister, Ian. 2007. "The Personalization of Politics." in *The Oxford Handbook of Political Behaviour,* edited by Russel J. Dalton and Hans-Dieter Klingemann, 571-585.

McCombs, Maxwell E., and Donald L. Shaw. 1972. "The Agenda-Setting Function of Mass Media." *The Public Opinion Quarterly* 36(2): 176-187. http://www.jstor.org/stable/2747787.

Neville-Shepard, Ryan, & Casey Ryan Kelly. 2020. "Whipping it out: guns, campaign advertising, and the White masculine spectacle." *Critical Studies in Media Communication* 37(5): 466-479. https://doi.org/10.1080/15295036.2020.1813902

Pateman, Carole, and Charles W. Mills. 2007. *Contract and Domination.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Reese, Stephen. 2001. "Prologue - Framing Public Life." In *Framing Public Life: Perspectives on Media and our Understanding of the Social World,* edited by Stephen Reese, Oscar Gandy, & August Grant, 7-31. London: Routledge.

Sampert, Shannon, and Linda Trimble. 2010. *Mediating Canadian Politics.* Toronto: Pearson.

Simon Fraser University. 2021. "Canadian Election Results by Party: 1867 to 2021." Accessed March 29, 2023. https://www.sfu.ca/~aheard/elections/1867-present.html

Shoemaker, Pamela, and Timothy Vos. 2009. "The Significance of Gatekeeping." in *Gatekeeping Theory,* 1-8. New York: Routledge.

Smith, Jessica C. 2021. "Masculinity and femininity in media representations of party leadership candidates: men 'play the gender card' too." *British Politics.* https://doi.org/10.1057/s41293-021-00172-w

Tasker, John Paul. 2021a. "O'Toole urges Canadians to punish Trudeau for calling 'unwanted and unnecessary election.'" *CBC News,* September 14, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/otoole-trudeau-attacks-unwanted-election-1.6175091

Tasker, John Paul. 2021b. "'Trudeau is bad for Canada,' Singh says as Liberal leader asks progressives to unite." *CBC News,* September 17, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/trudeau-is-bad-for-canada-singh-says-1.6179902

Thurton, David. 2021. "Annamie Paul is leading the Green Party's national campaign – but hasn't left Toronto once." *CBC News,* September 4, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/annamie-paul-green-party-federal-election-1.6162700

Tolley, Erin. 2013. "How Race Affects the Media's Coverage of Candidates in Canadian Politics." PhD diss., Queen's University. QSpace Dissertations, Theses, and Projects.

Tolley, Erin. 2016. *Framed: Media and the Coverage of Race in Canadian Politics.* Vancouver: UBC Press.

Trimble, Linda. 2017. *Ms. Prime Minister: Gender, Media, and Leadership.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Trimble, Linda, Daisy Raphael, Shannon Sampert, Angelia Wagner, and Bailey Gerrits. 2015. "Politicizing Bodies: Hegemonic Masculinity, Heteronormativity, and Racism in News Representations of Canadian Political Party Leadership Candidates." *Women's Studies in Communication* 38(3): 314-330. https://doi.org/10.1080/07491409.2015.1062836

Trimble, Linda, and Natasja Treiberg. 2015. "Textual Analysis." In *Explorations: A Navigator's Guide to Research in Canadian Political Science*, edited by Loleen Berdahl and Keith Archer, 227-244. 3rd ed. Don Mills: Oxford University Press.

Trimble, Linda, Angelia Wagner, Shannon Sampert, Daisy Raphael, and Bailey Gerrits. 2013. "Is it Personal? Gendered Mediation in News Coverage of Canadian National Party Leadership Contests, 1975-2012." *The International Journal of Press/Politics* 18(4): 462-481. doi:10.1177/1940161213495455

Tuchman, Gaye. 2000. "The Symbolic Annihilation of Women by the Mass Media." In *Culture and Politics,* edited by Lane Crothers & Charles Lockhart, 150-174. New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

Wherry, Aaron. 2017. "As Jagmeet Singh steps forward, is Canada ready for a non-white federal leader?" *CBC News,* May 21, 2017. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/wherry-jagmeet-singh-1.4119920

Original Sources

Alini, Erica. 2021. "From new benefits to new taxes: How the Liberal platform would affect your bottom line." *Global News,* September 1, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8158339/liberals-election-platform-pocketbook-promises/

Anglin, Howard. 2021. "Winners and losers of the 2021 election." *Global News,* September 21, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8208426/canada-election-winners-and-losers/

Bailey, Ian. 2021. "Canada federal election: Four highlights from Thursday's English-language leaders' debate." *Globe and Mail,* September 9, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/canada/article-watch-live-federal-leaders-square-off-thursday-at-9-pm-et-in-english/

Bailey, Ian. 2021. "O'Toole vows leadership with 'new style.'" *Globe and Mail,* August 16, 2021.

Bailey, Ian. 2021. "Politics Briefing: Liberal and Conservative leaders clash over the cost of party platforms." *Globe and Mail,* September 1, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-politics-briefing-liberal-and-conservative-leaders-clash-over-the-cost/

Bailey, Ian, & Laura Stone. 2021. "Conservative leader Erin O'Toole disappointed in party's results, plasn to launch review of electoral strategy." *Globe and Mail,* September 21, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-conservative-leader-erin-otoole-disappointed-in-partys-results-plans/

Blackwell, Tom. 2021. "Trudeau liberals hang onto power; Unclear if prime minister will have much to celebrate when all is said and done." *National Post,* September 21, 2021.

Boswell, Randy. 2021. "Conservatives' Erin O'Toole has shot himself in the foot – twice – with murky stance on gun control." *Global News,* September 6, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8170051/conservatives-erin-otoole-gun-control/

Boynton, Sean. 2021. "Trudeau plays defence as opposition leaders fight for points in English election debate." *Global News,* September 9, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8179622/canada-election-english-debate-wrap/

Boynton, Sean, & David Lao. 2021. "What happened during the federal leaders' English debate? Here are the highlights." *Global News,* September 10, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8179925/canada-election-federal-english-debate-highlights/

Bryden, Joan. 2021. "Parties prepare for election like no other; Campaigns aim to spread the word, not the virus." *National Post,* August 16, 2021.

Brethour, Patrick. 2021. "Surge in Ottawa's spending not worrying voters, pollsters say." *Globe and Mail,* August 16, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-costed-liberal-platform-details-78-billion-in-new-spending-over-five/

Clark, Campbell. 2021. "Party leaders haven't made a compelling case for voters." *Globe and Mail,* September 20, 2021. *Globe and Mail,* September 20, 2021.

Clark, Campbell. 2021. "Trudeau sets out to win the day but leaves the future of Canada for another time." *Globe and Mail,* August 16, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-trudeau-sets-out-to-win-the-day-but-leaves-the-future-of-canada-for/

Connolly, Amanda, & Aaron D'Andrea. 2021. "Will Trudeau's election gamble pay off? Polls now closed except to those in line." *Global News,* September 20, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8199211/canada-election-vote-polls/

Curry, Bill, & Campbell Clark. 2021. "Justin Trudeau releases Liberals' multibillion dollar platform; includes 15% tax for high-income earners." *Globe and Mail,* September 1, 2021.

Dib, Lina. 2021. "Trudeau announces Canadians will go to the polls to elect the 44th Canadian Parliament." *Global News,* August 15, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8113947/trudeau-announces-canadians-will-go-to-the-polls/

Doyle, John. 2021. "The farce of Canada's televised federal leaders' debate is an insult to viewers and voters." *Globe and Mail,* September 10, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/arts/television/article-farce-of-a-televised-election-debate-an-insult-to-viewers-and-voters/

Fife, Robert, & Menaka Raman-Wilms. 2021. "Jagmeet Singh's popularity and record key to NDP success this election." *Globe and Mail,* August 15, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-singhs-popularity-and-record-key-to-ndp-success-this-election/

Fife, Robert, Marieke Walsh, & Steven Chase. 2021. "Trudeau triggers snap election, sending Canadians to the polls on September 20." *Globe and Mail,* August 15, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-gg-dissolves-parliament-at-trudeaus-request-triggering-sept-20/

Fournier, Philippe J. 2021. "338Canada: Trudeau's election to lose." *Macleans,* August 15, 2021. https://macleans.ca/politics/ottawa/338canada-trudeaus-election-to-lose/

Francis, Diane. 2021. "Everyone needs to get behind O'Toole." *National Post,* September 10, 2021.

Gilmore, Rachel. 2021. "Erin O'Toole released his election platform. What promises could hit your pocketbook?" *Global News,* August 16, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8116678/election-canada-conservative-platform-pocketbook/#:~:text=O'Toole's%20platform%20touched%20on,to%20have%20fixed%20food%20prices.

Gilmore, Rachel. 2021. "The NDP wants a wealth tax. Would it work?" *Global News,* August 13, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8107509/singh-ndp-platform-election-2021-wealth-tax/

Global News Staff. 2021. "Green Party unveils platform, vows to cancel pipelines, boost carbon prices." *Global News,* September 7, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8172451/green-party-platform-cancel-pipelines-carbon-prices/

Globe and Mail Editorial Board. 2021. "Singh, Trudeau spar over climate change, reconciliation in final leaders' debate." *Globe and Mail,* September 9, 2021.

Globe and Mail Editorial Board. 2021. "To avoid shooting himself in the foot, Erin O'Toole is trying to holster the gun issue." *Globe and Mail,* September 7, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/opinion/editorials/article-to-avoid-a-shooting-himself-in-the-foot-erin-otoole-is-trying-to/

Hutchins, Aaron. 2021. "Where might Trudeau be most vulnerable? And other big questions." *Macleans,* August 16, 2021. https://macleans.ca/politics/ottawa/federal-election-2021-where-might-trudeau-be-most-vulnerable-and-other-big-questions/

Ibbitson, John. 2021. "As Trudeau attempts offensive play, moderators keep debate civil, and bland." *Globe and Mail,* September 10, 2021.

Ibbitson, John. 2021. "Erin O'Toole's Conservatives target suburban voters in election platform of thoughtful populism." *Globe and Mail,* August 16, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-erin-otooles-conservatives-target-suburban-voters-in-election-platform/

Ibbitson, John. 2021. "Erin O'Toole tried to refashion the Conservative movement and deserves another chance to lead." *Globe and Mail,* September 20, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-erin-otoole-tried-to-refashion-the-conservative-movement-he-should-be/

Ibbitson, John. 2021. "O'Toole pivots on gun policy in increasingly tight election race." *Globe and Mail,* September 5, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-erin-otoole-pivots-on-gun-policy-in-increasingly-tight-election-race/

Ibbitson, John. 2021. "Trudeau, O'Toole prevented from launching attack sat each other in tightly controlled debate." *Globe and Mail,* September 9, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-trudeau-otoole-prevented-from-launching-attacks-at-each-other-in/

Ivison, John. 2021. "Dry, retread Liberal platform is more good news for O'Toole campaign." *National Post,* September 1, 2021. https://nationalpost.com/news/politics/election-2021/john-ivison-dry-retread-liberal-platform-is-more-good-news-for-otoole-campaign

Ivison, John. 2021. "O'Toole's reversal on gun policy may save his campaign." *National Post,* September 5, 2021. https://nationalpost.com/news/politics/election-2021/john-ivison-otooles-gun-policy-reversal-may-save-his-campaign

Ivison, John. 2021. "PM's majority dreams hit the ultimate ennui." *National Post,* September 21, 2021.

Kirkup, Kristy, Marieke Walsh, Laura Stone, & Ian Bailey. 2021. "Trudeau vows to extend COVID-19 business supports to March, as O'Toole proposes scrapping Liberal childcare plan in platform release." *Globe and Mail,* August 16, 2021.

Ling, Justin. 2021. "All of Justin Trudeau's unfinished business." *Macleans,* August 15, 2021. https://macleans.ca/opinion/all-of-justin-trudeaus-unfinished-business/

Maddeaux, Sabrina. 2021. "A selfish election call as Kabul burns, Trudeau struggles to justify why election needed now." *National Post,* August 16, 2021.

Maher, Stephen. 2021. "O'Toole's blind side, Trudeau's big gamble and other keys to the campaign." *Macleans.* August 16, 2021. https://macleans.ca/politics/otooles-blind-side-trudeaus-big-gamble-and-other-keys-to-the-campaign/

Maher, Stephen. 2021. "Questions for Erin O'Toole the Frontrunner." *Macleans,* September 5, 2021. https://macleans.ca/opinion/questions-for-erin-otoole-the-frontrunner/

Maloney, Ryan. 2021. "Annamie Paul's Greens can turn page on party turmoil with a few more seats, analysts say." *CBC News,* August 15, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/annamie-paul-green-election-1.6139001

Maloney, Ryan. 2021. "Running from behind, Erin O'Toole gets a high-stakes chance to reintroduce himself." *CBC News,* August 15, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/erin-otoole-election-1.6137740

Maloney, Ryan. 2021. "'Wildcards': Jagmeet Singh's New Democrats say they're running to win an election they didn't want." *CBC News,* August 15, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/jagmeet-singh-ndp-election-1.6138508

Mason, Gary. 2021. "Erin O'Toole and the Conservative Party brace for an ugly war over his shift to the left." *Globe and Mail,* September 21, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/opinion/article-erin-otoole-and-the-conservative-party-brace-for-an-ugly-war-over-his/

Nardi, Christopher. 2021. "Leaders trade barbs as campaign comes to a close; Conservatives, Liberals in dead heat with polls." *National Post,* September 20, 2021.

Parkinson, David. 2021. "We've entered the era of cooperative skepticism as voters signal Trudeau's third term must be about execution." *Globe and Mail,* September 21, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/commentary/article-election-results-a-wakeup-call-to-liberals-on-their-management-style/

Platt, Brian. 2021. "Leaders' debate foes take aim at Trudeau." *National Post,* September 10, 2021.

Platt, Brian. 2021. "Too close to call: Slow results set up tense all-nighter; Liberals, Tories, and NDP each competitive." *National Post,* September 21, 2021.

Proudfoot, Shannon. 2021. "The election that disappointed everyone." *Macleans,* September 21, 2021. https://macleans.ca/politics/ottawa/the-election-that-disappointed-everyone/

Raman-Wilms, Menaka. 2021. "Singh says he's confident he will remain NDP leader despite lack of seat gains." *Globe and Mail,* September 21, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-singh-says-hes-confident-he-will-remain-ndp-leader-despite-lack-of/

Rendell, Mark. 2021. "Tax credits underpin Conservative plan to spur hiring, growth." *Globe and Mail,* August 16, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/article-tax-credits-underpin-conservative-plan-to-spur-hiring-growth/

Reynolds, Christopher. 2021. "Election endangers Canadians, O'Toole says; but Tory leader sidesteps vaccine question." *National Post,* August 16, 2021.

Reynolds, Christopher. 2021. "Jagmeet Singh takes aim at billionaires, promises to close corporate tax loopholes." *Global News,* August 30, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8151715/jagmeet-singh-billionaires-promises-corporate-tax-loopholes/

Reynolds, Christopher. 2021. "NDP Leader Jagmeet Singh vows to crack down on billionaires, close corporate tax loopholes." *Globe and Mail,* August 30, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-ndp-leader-jagmeet-singh-vows-to-crack-down-on-billionaires-close/

Russell, Andrew. 2021. "A minority government? A coalition? Here's a look at some federal election outcomes." *Global News,* September 20, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8206088/federal-election-minority-government-what-happens-now/

Schlote, Warren. 2021. "Federal NDP leader Jagmeet Singh makes second visit to Sudbury." *CBC News,* September 12, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/sudbury/jagmeet-singh-makes-second-stop-1.6173180

Smith, Marie-Danielle. 2021. "Who won the leaders debate? Everyone, and no one: poll." *Macleans,* September 14, 2021. https://macleans.ca/politics/ottawa/who-won-the-leaders-debate-everyone-and-no-one/

Snowdon, Frazer. 2021. "Green Party faces challenges heading into fall election." *Global News,* August 15, 2021. https://globalnews.ca/news/8114517/green-party-annamie-paul-election-challenges/

Snyder, Jesse. 2021. "Green woes may have critical impact on vote." *National Post,* September 8, 2021.

Snyder, Jesse. 2021. "'There is so much more we can do,' PM assailed for response to fall of Kabul." *National Post,* August 16, 2021.

Stone, Laura, Marieke Walsh, & Bill Curry. 2021. "Trudeau says no regrets for election call during the pandemic; O'Toole pitches a 'changed' Conservative party." *Globe and Mail,* September 10, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-trudeau-says-no-regrets-for-election-call-during-the-pandemic-otoole/

Syed, Fatima. 2021. "Annamie Paul was the unexpected hero of the leaders' debate." *Macleans,* September 10, 2021. https://macleans.ca/opinion/federal-leaders-debate-listening-to-annamie-paul/

Syed, Fatima. 2021. "Federal election 2021: What ever happened to 'better'?" *Macleans,* September 20, 2021. https://macleans.ca/opinion/federal-election-2021-what-ever-happened-to-better/

Tasker, John Paul. 2021. "Erin O'Toole opposes mandatory vaccination for federal public servants, travellers." *CBC News,* August 16, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/otoole-opposes-mandatory-vaccination-1.6142113

Tasker, John Paul. 2021. "Fractious debate sees leaders trade blows over climate change, pandemic recovery and cost of living." *CBC News,* September 9, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/english-leaders-debate-election-2021-1.6170042

Tasker, John Paul. 2021. "Liberal Party releases multibillion-dollar election platform for post-pandemic recovery." *CBC News,* September 1, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/liberal-party-election-platform-1.6160918

Thurton, David. 2021. "Green Party postpones national convention as federal election gets underway." *CBC News,* August 16, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/green-party-postpones-national-convention-as-federal-election-gets-underway-1.6143177

Tunney, Catharine. 2021. "NDP promises universal pharmacare, mental health supports in first mandate, if elected." *CBC News,* August 12, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/ndp-commitments-election-1.6138451

Urback, Robyn. 2021. "If this election was a test of leadership, all of them failed." *Globe and Mail,* September 20, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/opinion/article-if-this-election-was-a-test-of-leadership-all-of-them-failed/

Walsh, Marieke, & Bill Curry. 2021. "Trudeau's re-elected minority government to face demands from Bloc, NDP." *Globe and Mail,* September 21, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-trudeaus-re-elected-minority-government-to-face-demands-from-bloc-ndp/

Walsh, Marieke, Laura Stone, & Kristy Kirkup. 2021. "Canada's 2021 federal election: It's neck and neck between the Liberals, Conservatives as voters head to the polls." *Globe and Mail,* September 20, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-trudeau-barnstorms-country-ahead-of-monday-vote-as-otoole-campaigns-in/

Walsh, Marieke, Laura Stone, & Kristy Kirkup. 2021. "English-language leaders' debate: Justin Trudeau put on defensive over early election call, foreign policy." *Globe and Mail,* September 9, 2021. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/politics/article-english-language-debate-justin-trudeau-put-on-defensive-over-early/

Wells, Paul. 2021. "Election 2021: Let the caring begin." *Macleans,* August 15, 2021. https://macleans.ca/politics/election-2021-let-the-caring-begin/

Wells, Paul. 2021. "Erin O'Toole fills in blanks." *Macleans,* August 16, 2021. https://macleans.ca/politics/ottawa/erin-otoole-fills-in-blanks/

Wells, Paul. 2021. "The Liberal platform, or CARPA diem." *Macleans,* September 1, 2021. https://macleans.ca/politics/ottawa/federal-election-2021-the-liberal-platform-or-carpa-diem/

Wherry, Aaron. 2021. "Put on defensive in leaders' debate, Trudeau tries to caution against cynicism." *CBC News,* September 10, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/analysis-debate-english-language-1.6170302

Winter, Jennifer. 2021. "Green party climate platform is both ambitious and unrealistic." *CBC News,* September 16, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/opinion/opinion-election-green-party-climate-platform-1.6175939

Zimonjic, Peter. 2021. "Green platform promises big, largely uncosted social programs, end to fossil fuel industry." *CBC News,* September 7, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/annamie-paul-green-party-platform-1.6167167

Zimonjic, Peter. 2021. "O'Toole amends platform on gun control, but questions remain about what change means." *CBC News,* September 6, 2021. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/otoole-trudeau-gun-control-platform-change-1.6166354